

Tiika 25 (first part):

25. ``dhammaniruttaabhilaape"ti ettha dhamma-saddo sabhaavavaacakoti katvaa aaha``sabhaavaniruttii"ti, avipariitaniruttiiti attho.

As to the expression, enunciation of language dealing with dhamma, here he said: the natural language, language that is unequivocal, is the meaning.

tenaaha ``abyabhicaarii vohaaro"ti, tassa tassa atthassa bodhane pa.tiniyatasambandho saddavohaaroti attho.

Therefore he said, "common usage, which is normal, without exceptions", concerning the understanding of such and such meaning, there is a fixed connection, thus, a common usage of words, is the meaning.

tadabhilaapeti tassa sabhaavaniruttisa~n~nitassa abyabhicaarivohaarassa abhilaapane.

As to the expression, (any knowledge falling within the category) concerned with the enunciation of that, this means, concerned with the enunciation of that so called natural language, of that normal, common speech.

saa panaaya.m sabhaavanirutti maagadhabhaasaa. atthato naamapa~n~nattiiti aacariyaa.

This natural language is the Magadha Language. As to the meaning of this, the teachers say that it is a name.

phassoti ca sabhaavanirutti, phassa.m phassaati na sabhaavaniruttiiti dassitovaayamattho.

The word phasso, contact, is natural language, but phassa.m and phassaa are not, this is the meaning that is shown.

na ca avacana.m eva.mpakaara.m atthi.

And in this manner there is not the wrong word.

tasmaa vacanabhuutaaya eva tassaa sabhaavaniruttiyaa abhilaape uccaara.neti attho da.t.thabbo.

Therefore, the meaning of "utterance" should be seen as the enunciation of this natural language by the constitution of speech.

ta.m sabhaavaniruttisadda.m aaramma.na.m katvaa paccavekkhantassa
tasmi.m sabhaavaniruttaabhilaape pabhedagata.m ~naa.na.m
niruttipa.tisambhidaa,

When one is reviewing that expression of natural language by making the sound of it the object, the knowledge that falls under the category of the utterance of natural language is the discrimination of language.

``evamaya.m niruttipa.tisambhidaa saddaaramma.naa naama jaataa, na
pa~n~nattiaaramma.naa"ti (vibha0 a.t.tha0 718)

Thus it is said, "this discrimination of language comes to have sounds as its object, not a concept."

ca a.t.thakathaaya.m vuttattaa niruttisaddaaramma.naaya
sotavi~n~naa.naviithiyaa parato manodvaare niruttipa.tisambhidaa
pavattatiiti vadanti.

And the sayings of the commentaries state that the discrimination of language occurs with the sound of language as object in the ear-door process and afterwards in the mind-door process.

``niruttipa.tisambhidaa paccuppannaaramma.naa"ti (vibha0 749) ca
vacanasadda.m gahetvaa pacchaa jaanana.m sandhaaya vuttanti.

As to the expression (in the Book of Analysis): "The discrimination of language has a present object", it is said in this connection that after having grasped the sound of speech there is understanding.

English:

As to the expression, enunciation of language dealing with dhamma, here he said: the natural language, language that is unequivocal, is the meaning.

Therefore he said, "common usage, which is normal, without exceptions", concerning the understanding of such and such meaning, there is a fixed connection, thus, a common usage of words, is the meaning.

As to the expression, (any knowledge falling within the category) concerned with the enunciation of that, this means, concerned with the enunciation of that so called natural language, of that normal, common speech.

This natural language is the Magadha Language. As to the meaning of this, the teachers say that it is a name.

The word phasso, contact, is natural language, but <phassa.m> and <phassaa> are not, this is the meaning that is shown.

And in this manner there is not the wrong word.

Therefore, the meaning of “utterance” should be seen as the enunciation of this natural language by the constitution of speech.

When one is reviewing that expression of natural language by making the sound of it the object, the knowledge that falls under the category of the utterance of natural language is the discrimination of language.

Thus it is said, “this discrimination of language comes to have sounds as its object, not a concept.”

And the sayings of the commentaries state that the discrimination of language occurs with the sound of language as object in the ear-door process and afterwards in the mind-door process.

As to the expression (in the Book of Analysis): “The discrimination of language has a present object”, it is said in this connection that after having grasped the sound of speech there is understanding.

(last part of section 25 untranslated)

eva.m pana a~n~nasmi.m paccuppannaaramma.ne a~n~na.m
paccuppannaaramma.na.m vuttanti aapajjati. yathaa pana
dibbasota~naa.na.m manussaadisaddabhedanicchayassa
paccayabhuuta.m ta.mta.msaddavibhaavaka.m, eva.m
sabhaavaasabhaavaniruttinicchayassa paccayabhuuta.m
paccuppannasabhaavaniruttisaddaaramma.na.m
ta.mvibhaavaka.m~naa.na.m niruttipa.tisambhidaati vuccamaane na koci
paa.livirodho. ``ta.m sabhaavaniruttisadda.m aaramma.na.m katvaa

paccavekkhantassaa"ti ca` paccuppannasaddaaramma.na.m
paccavekkha.na.m pavattentassaa"ti na nasakkaa vattu.m. ta~nhi
~naa.na.m sabhaavanirutti.m vibhaaventameva
ta.mta.msaddapaccavekkha.naanantara.m
ta.mta.mpabhedanicchayahetubhaavato nirutti.m bhindanta.m
pa.tivijjhantameva uppajjatiiti pabhedagatampi hotiiti.

"The Path of Purification" (Visuddhimagga) Ch. XIV

[Regarding the 4 discriminations: meaning, law, language, perspicuity]

26. "Knowledge about kinds of knowledge" (par.21): when a man is reviewing and makes any of the foregoing kinds of knowledge the object [of his knowledge], then any knowledge in him that has knowledge as its object is "discrimination of perspicuity", and so is any knowledge about these aforesaid kinds of knowledge, which is concerned with details of their individual domains, functions, and so on.

Vis 27

"The Path of Purification" (Visuddhimagga) Ch. XIV

27. And these four kinds of discrimination can be placed in two categories: the plane of the trainer and the plane of the non-trainer. Herein, those of the chief disciples come into the category of the non-trainer' plane. Those of the Elder Aananda, the householder Citta, the layman Dhammika, the householder Upaali, the laywoman Khujjuttaraa, etc., come into the category of the trainer's plane.

Vis 28

[Regarding the two planes (trainer and non-trainer) of the four kinds of discrimination]

28. And though they come into the categories of the two planes thus, they are nevertheless distinguishable in five aspects, that is to say, as achievement, mastery of scriptures, hearing, questioning, and prior effort. Herein, "achievement" is the reaching of Arahantship. "Mastery of scriptures" is mastery of the Buddha's word. "Hearing" is learning the Dhamma carefully and attentively. "Questioning" is discussion of knotty passages and explanatory passages in the texts, commentaries, and so on. "Prior effort" is devotion to insight in the dispensation of former Buddhas, up to the vicinity of [the stages of] conformity and change-of-lineage by one who has practiced [the duty of] going [with the meditation subject on alms round] and coming back [with it]. (11)

29. Others have said:

'A prior effort, and great knowledge, [knowledge of] dialects, of scriptures, and questioning, and then achievement, and likewise waiting on a teacher, success in friends--these are conditions productive of discriminations'.

30. Herein, "prior effort" is the same as already stated. "Great learning" is skill in some science or sphere of craft. "Dialects" means skill in the hundred-and-one tongues, particularly in that of Magadha. "Scriptures" means mastery of the Buddha's word, even if only of the Chapter of Similes. (12) "Questioning" is questioning about defining the meaning of even a single stanza. "Achievement" is stream-entry ... or Arahantship. "Waiting on a teacher" is living with very learned intelligent teachers. "Success in friends" is acquisition of friends such as that. [443]

31. Herein, Buddhas and Paccekabuddhas reach discriminations through prior effort and through achievement. Disciples do so through all these means. And there is no special way of developing a meditation subject in order to attain discriminations. But in trainers the attaining of the discriminations comes about next upon the liberation consisting in

trainers' fruition, and in non-trainers it does so next upon the liberation consisting in non-trainers' fruition. For the discriminations come to success in noble ones only through the noble fruition as the ten powers do in Perfect Ones.

So these were the discriminations referred to when it was said above 'It is of four kinds ... as the four discriminations' (par. 8).

(11) The expression "gatapaccaagatikabhaava" refers to the practice of 'carrying the meditation subject to and from the alms round', which is described at MA.i,257 in detail. The same expression is also used of a certain kind of refuse-rag (see Ch. II, par.17).

(12) 'The "Chapter of Similes" is the Chapter of Twin Verses in the Dhammapada (Dh.1-20), they say. Others say it is the Book of Pairs in the First Fifty (M. Suttas 31-40)' (Pm. 436).

Vis. 31

Vis. 32:

32. (v) How is it [understanding] developed? Now the things classed as aggregates, bases, elements, faculties, truths, dependent origination, etc., are the "soil" of this understanding, and the [first] two purifications, namely, purification of virtue and purification of consciousness, are its "roots", while the five purifications, namely, purification of view, purification by overcoming doubt, purification by knowledge and vision of what is the path and what is not the path, purification by knowledge and vision of the way, and purification by knowledge and vision, are the "trunk". Consequently, one who is perfecting these should first fortify his knowledge by learning and questioning about these things that are the 'soil' after he has perfected the two purifications that are

the 'roots', then he can develop the five purifications that are the 'trunk'. This is in brief. The detail is as follows.

[B. DESCRIPTION OF THE FIVE AGGREGATES]

33. When it was said above 'the things classed as aggregates, bases, elements, faculties, truths, dependent origination, etc., are the 'soil', the "aggregates" here are the five aggregates, that is to say, the materiality aggregate, the feeling aggregate, the perception aggregate, the formations aggregate, and the consciousness aggregate.

Vis 2:

34. Herein, all kinds of states whatsoever that have the characteristic of 'being molested' (ruppana) by cold, etc., taken all together should be understood as the materiality (ruupa) aggregate.

1. That is of one kind with the characteristic of 'being molested'.
2. It is also of two kinds when classed as (a) primary entity (bhuuta)

and (b) derived [by clinging] (upaadaaya).

Pali Vis. 34: tattha ya.m ki~nci siitaadiihi ruppanalakkha.na.m
dhammajaata.m, sabba.m ta.m ekato katvaa ruupakkhandhoti veditabba.m.
tadeta.m ruppanalakkha.nena ekavidhampi bhuutopaadaayabhedato
duvidha.m.

Tiika:

34. Tatthaati tesu pa~ncasu khandhesu. Ya.m ki~nciiti
anavasesapariyaadaana.m.

As to the word, herein, this means, in the five aggregates. As to the
expression, whatsoever, this means an all-inclusive treatment.

..... (grammatical explanation of the expression ya.m ki~nci, what so ever.)

Siitaadiihiiti siitu.nhajighacchaapipaasaadiihi. Hetu-atthe ceta.m
kara.navacana.m.

(Molested) by cold etc. , this means by cold, heat, hunger, thirst, etc. This is
the instrumental case with the meaning of cause.

Bhuutopaadaayabhedatoti ettha tadadhiinavuttitaaya bhavati ettha
upaadaayaruupanti bhuuta.m.

As to the expression, with regard to the classification as principal elements
and derived elements, here, the latter proceed by the condition of
dependence on them (principle elements), and thus they have become
derived (by clinging).

.....

English:

As to the word, herein, this means, in the five aggregates. As to the
expression, whatsoever, this means an all-inclusive treatment.

..... (grammatical explanation of the expression ya.m ki~nci, what so ever.)

(Molested) by cold etc. , this means by cold, heat, hunger, thirst, etc. This is
the instrumental case with the meaning of cause.

As to the expression, with regard to the classification as principal elements
and derived elements, here, the latter proceed by the condition of

dependence on them (principle elements), and thus they have become derived (by clinging).

.....

Vis. 35. Herein (a) "primary materiality" is of four kinds as the earth element, water element, fire element, and air element. Their characteristic, function, and manifestation have been given under the definition of the four elements (Ch. XI, 87, 93); but as to the proximate cause, each has the other three as its proximate cause. [444]

Vis. 35. tattha bhūtarūpa.m catubbidha.m pathaviidhaatu aapodhaatu tejodhaatu vaayodhaatuuti. taasa.m lakkha.narasapaccupa.t.thaanaani catudhaatuvavatthaane vuttaani. pada.t.thaanato pana taa sabbaapi avasesadhaatuttayapada.t.thaanaa.

words:

kaama (f): sense desire, object of sense-desire.

pakaara: mode, way.

antara: between

paaleti: to preserve

vitthambeti: to extend, expand

sa”ngathita: held together.

avasesa, sesa: remaining

Tiika 35:

35. Kaama.m catudhaatuvavatthaane vacanatthaaditopi bhūtaani vibhaavitaaneva,

After he has explained the principal elements as to word meaning and so on in the definition of the four elements as objects of sense desire *,

sabhaavadhammaana.m pana lakkha.naativibhaavanaati katvaa
and he has given the explanation of the characteristics and so on of these dhammas which each have their own distinct nature,

vutta.m “lakkha.narasapaccupa.t.thaanaani catudhaatuvavatthaane
vuttaanii”ti.

he said, “Their characteristic, function, and manifestation have been given
under the definition of the four elements”.

Tattha pada.t.thaanassa avuttattaa aaha “pada.t.thaanato panaa”ti-aadi.
Since he had not given the proximate cause, he said, “as to their proximate
cause and so on”.

Avacana~nca tassa tassatthassa paccayatoti ettha pakaarantarena
vibhaavitattaati da.t.thabba.m.

And the fact that he did not mention the meaning in each case with regard
to the condition should be seen here as a way of explanation in the
meantime (?).

Sabbaapiiti catassopi dhaatuyo.

As to the expression, also all of them, this means, also the four elements.

Aaposa"ngahitaaya tejonupaalitaaya vaayovitthambhitaaya eva
pathaviidhaatuyaa pavatti,

The element of earth proceeds because it is held together by water,
maintained by fire, and distended by wind.

na a~n~nathaati saa sesabhuutattayapada.t.thaanaa, evamitaraapiiti aaha
“avasesadhaatuttayapada.t.thaanaa”ti.

Thus, it is not otherwise that the other great elements are its proximate
cause, and therefore he said also with regard to the other elements: “each
has the other three as its proximate cause”.

English:

After he has explained the principal elements as to word meaning and so
on in the definition of the four elements as objects of sense desire *,
and he has given the explanation of the characteristics and so on of these
dhammas which each have their own distinct nature,

he said, "Their characteristic, function, and manifestation have been given under the definition of the four elements".

Since he had not given the proximate cause, he said, "as to their proximate cause and so on".

And the fact that he did not mention the meaning in each case with regard to the condition should be seen here as a way of explanation in the meantime (?). As to the expression, also all of them, this means, also the four elements.

The element of earth proceeds because it is held together by water, maintained by fire, and distended by wind.

Thus, it is not otherwise that the other (three) great elements are its proximate cause, and therefore he said also with regard to the other elements: "each has the other three as its proximate cause".

* In Ch XI, they are treated under the aspect of the foulness of the body since they are objects of desire.

Vis. 36. (b) "Derived materiality" is of twenty-four kinds as eye, ear, nose, tongue, body, visible datum, sound, odour, flavour, femininity faculty, masculinity faculty, life faculty, heart-basis; bodily intimation, verbal intimation; space element; lightness of matter, malleability of matter, wieldiness of matter, growth of matter, continuity of matter, ageing of matter, impermanence of matter, and physical nutriment.

Vis. 36. upaadaaruupa.m catuviisatividha.m cakkhu, sota.m, ghaana.m, jivhaa, kaayo, ruupa.m, saddo, gandho, raso, itthindriya.m, purisindriya.m, jiiivitindriya.m, hadayavatthu, kaayavi~n~natti, vaciivi~n~natti, aakaasadhaatu, ruupassa lahutaa, ruupassa mudutaa , ruupassa kamma~n~nataa, ruupassa upacayo, ruupassa santati, ruupassa jarataa, ruupassa aniccataa, kaba.liikaaro aahaaroti.

Tiika 36, part I:

words:

catuviisati: twentyfour

ga.nana: number

paricchedo: division, chapter.

bala: strong.

pa.tisedhaprohibition, exclusion

vattabba=vaditabba: fit to be told

aavi: clear, evident.

parato: later on

adhi.t.thaati: stand on, be fixed on, concentrate on.

Tiika text 36:

(b)Catuviisatividhanti ga.nanaparcchedo balaruupaadiina.m

pa.tisedhanattho.

As to the expression, of twentyfour kinds, the division in numbers has the meaning of exclusion from the strong material phenomena and so on.

Tattha ya.m vattabba.m, ta.m parato aavi bhavissati.

Here what is fit to be told will become evident later on.

Cakkhatiiti cakkhu, vi~n~naa.naadhi.t.thita.m ruupa.m assaadata.m viya hotiiti attho.

It relishes, thus it is an eye *, the meaning is: it is as it were enjoying the visible object that consciousness is fixed on.

Cakkhatiiti hi aya.m cakkhati-saddo "madhu.m cakkhati, bya~njana.m cakkhatii"ti-aadiisu viya assaadanattho.

As to the word relishes, this means enjoyment, just like he enjoys honey, curry and so on.

Vutta~nheta.m "cakkhu.m kho, maaga.n.diya, ruupaaraama.m ruuparata.m ruupasamuditan"ti (ma. ni. 2.209).

This was said (M I, 503): "The eye, Magandiya, delights in visible object, is delighted by it, rejoices in it."

A.t.thakathaayampi vuccati "ruupesu aavi~nchanarasan"ti (visuddhi. 2.433; dha. sa. a.t.tha. 600).

It is also said in the Commentary that its function is picking up (an object) among material phenomena.

English:

As to the expression, of twentyfour kinds, the division in numbers has the meaning of exclusion from the strong material phenomena and so on.

Here what is fit to be told will become evident later on.

It relishes, thus it is an eye *, the meaning is: it is as it were enjoying the visible object that consciousness is fixed on.

As to the word relishes, this means enjoyment, just like he enjoys honey, curry and so on.

This was said (M I, 503): "The eye, Magandiya, delights in visible object, is delighted by it, rejoices in it."

It is also said in the Commentary that its function is picking up (an object) among material phenomena.

* See Vis. XV, 19. The eye cannot be attached, but this is a figurative way of speaking.

[Satipi sotaadiina.m saddaaramma.naadibhaave niru.lhattaa dassane eva cakkhu-saddo pavattati padumaadiisu pa"nkajaadisaddaa viyaati da.t.thabba.m.

Atha vaa cakkhatiiti vi~n~naa.naadhi.t.thita.m samavisama.m aacikkhanta.m viya abhibyatta.m vadanta.m viya hotiiti attho.

A.t.thakathaaya.m pana "vibhaaveti caa"ti (mahaani. a.t.tha. 13; vibha. a.t.tha. 154) vutta.m.

Ta.m anekathhattaa dhaatuuna.m vibhaavanatthataapi cakkhati-saddassa sambhavatiiti katvaa vutta.m. Su.naati etena, vi~n~naa.naadhi.t.thita.m saya.m vaa su.naatiiti sota.m. Ghaayati etena, saya.m vaa ghaayatiiti ghaana.m. Rasaggaha.namuulakattaa ajjhohara.nassa jivitanimitta.m aahaararaso jivita.m, tasmi.m ninnataaya ta.m avhaayatiiti jivhaa

niruttinayena. Kucchitaana.m saasavadhammaana.m aayo
uppatti.t.thaananti kaayo anuttariyahetubhaava.m anaagacchantesu
kaamaraaganidaanakkammajanesu, kaamaraagassa ca visesapaccayesu
ghaanajivhaakaayesu kaayassa visesato saasavapaccayatta. Tena hi
pho.t.thabbasukha.m assaadata satta methunampi sevanti.
Kaayindriyavatthukaa vaa cattaaro khandhaa
balavakaamaasavaadihetubhaavato visesena saasavaati kucchitaana.m
saasavadhammaana.m aayoti kaayo vutto.]

Tiika 36 Part II (omission of preceding section)

Some points from the omitted part are partly the same as Dispeller of
Delusion Ch II, Suttanta Division: jivaa, tongue, it evokes life, thus it is
tongue. (N: word association between jivita, life and jivaa, tongue. We must
eat in order to live).

Body: "It is the origin of vile states, subject to cankers; origin being the
place of arising. (Kucchitaana.m saasavadhammaana.m aayo
uppatti.t.thaananti kaayo). Beings who enjoy pleasant tangible object are
also after sexual intercourse (Tena hi pho.t.thabbasukha.m assaadata
satta methunampi sevanti.)

Tiika 36 text:

words:

ruupayati: it makes visible

vikaara: change

va.nna: colour, appearance

aapajjati: get into, produce, exhibit

aneka: diverse.

pakaaseti: to make known

apaaka.ta: unknown

pa.ticchanna: concealed

pesu~n~na (n): slander

Text:

Va.n.navikaara.m aapajjamaana.m hadaya"ngatabhaava.m ruupayatiiti ruupa.m, iva dassetiiti attho.

It makes visible a change of appearance that manifests the state of mind, and thus it is visible object, * as it is shown, is the meaning.

Anekatthattaa vaa dhaatuuna.m pakaasanattho eva ruupasaddo da.t.thabbo.

Or the term visible object should be seen as having the purpose of clarifying the diversity of the elements.

Sappatiiti saddo, udaahariiyati, sakehi vaa paccayehi sappiiyati sotavi~n~neyyabhaava.m upaniiyatiiti attho.

It is emitted and thus it is sound, it is uttered, or by its own conditions it is emitted, it brings along its nature of audibility, is the meaning.

Gandhayatiiti gandho, attano vatthu.m suucayati .m "ida.m sugandha.m, duggandhan"ti pakaaseti

It is smelt, thus it is odour; it betrays its own basis that is not known, it makes manifest "this is a good smell, this is a bad smell",

pa.ticchanna.m vaa pupphaphalaadi.m "idamettha atthii"ti pesu~n~na.m karonta.m viya hotiiti attho.

or it makes known what is concealed with regard to flowers and fruits, and so on, saying, "It is this here," just like the action of slander, is the meaning.

Rasanti ta.m sattaati raso, asaadentiiti attho.

Beings taste it, thus, it is taste; they enjoy it, is the meaning.

Itthiyaava indriya.m itthindriya.m, tathaa purisindriya.m.

The faculty of a woman is femininity faculty, and likewise there is masculinity faculty.

Jiivanti tena sahajaatadhammaati jiivita.m, tadeva indriya.m jiivitindriya.m.

By this the conascent realities live, thus it is life, and moreover, it is a faculty, life faculty **.

Hadaya~nca ta.m vatthu ca, hadayassa vaa manovi~n~naa.nassa vatthu hadayavatthu.

Heart and that base, or the base of the heart for mind-consciousness is the heartbase ***.

English:

Or the term visible object should be seen as having the purpose of clarifying the diversity of the elements.

It is emitted and thus it is sound, it is uttered, or by its own conditions it is emitted, it brings along its nature of audibility, is the meaning.

It is smelt, thus it is odour; it betrays its own basis that is not known, it makes manifest “this is a good smell, this is a bad smell”,

or it makes known what is concealed with regard to flowers and fruits, and so on, saying, “It is this here,” just like the action of slander, is the meaning.

Beings taste it, thus, it is taste; they enjoy it, is the meaning.

The faculty of a woman is feminity faculty, and likewise there is masculinity faculty.

By this the conascent realities live, thus it is life, and moreover, it is a faculty, life faculty **.

Heart and that base, or the base of the heart for mind-consciousness is the heartbase ***.

* A word association of ruupa, visible object and ruupayati: to make visible. When someone has a change in the colour of his face, it shows what is in his mind.

**This ruupa is only in a living body. It is produced by kamma.

** This is not in the enumeration of rūpas of the Dhammasangani, but it is mentioned in the Pa.t.thana Book of the Abhidhamma as “that ruupa”, being the base for cittas other than the five sense-cognitions.

36 part III

Relevant text of Vis. 36:

... bodily intimation, verbal intimation; space element; lightness of matter, malleability of matter, wieldiness of matter, growth of matter, continuity of matter, ageing of matter, impermanence of matter, and physical nutriment.

...kaayavi~n~natti, vaciivi~n~natti, aakaasadhaatu, ruupassa lahutaa, ruupassa mudutaa, ruupassa kamma~n~nataa, ruupassa upacayo, ruupassa santati, ruupassa jarataa, ruupassa aniccataa, kaba.liikaaro aahaaroti.

Text Tiika 36, part III:

words:

copana: agitation

adhippaaya(m): intention

vi~n~natti: communication.

viggaha: analysis, resolution (into parts)

dibbati: to enjoy

nippahanna: produced

Text:

Copanakaayabhaavato kaayo ca so adhippaayavi~n~naapanato vi~n~natti caati kaayavi~n~natti.

The body, with its nature of bodily agitation, and the intimation which makes known an intention, is thus bodily intimation.

Copanavaacaabhaavato, adhippaayavi~n~naapanato ca vacii ca saa vi~n~natti caati vaciivi~n~natti.

Speech with its nature of agitation of the voice, and this intimation which makes known an intention, is thus verbal intimation.

Viggahaabhaavato na kassati, kasitu.m chinditu.m na sakkaa, na vaa kaasati dibbatiiti akaasa.m, akaasameva aakaasa.m, tadeva nissattanijjiiva.t.thena aakaasadhaatu.

It is space, because it cannot be broken up, it cannot be ploughed *; it is not possible to plough it or to break it, or it does not appear, and thus, one does not enjoy what does not appear; what does not appear is space. Then, because it is without a living soul, it is the element of space.

Ruupassaati nipphannaruupassa. Lahubhaavo lahutaa.

As to the expression (lightness) of matter, of produced matter. The nature of being light is lightness.

Saya.m anipphannataaya “ruupassaa”ti visesita.m. Esa nayo sesesupi. Because in itself it is unproduced, it is explained as “of matter.” This method applies for the remaining qualities **.

Aya.m pana visesani kammani saadhu kamma~n~na.m, tassa bhaavo kamma~n~nataa.

This is being wieldy for different works, its nature is wieldiness.

Pa.thama.m, upari ca cayo pavatti upacayo.

The first and the later accumulation is the occurrence, integration.***

Pubbaaparavasena sambandhaa tati pavatti santati.

Because of what precedes and follows there are connections, it goes on, proceeds as continuation.

Aniccassa vinaasino bhaavo aniccataa.

Impermanence is the nature of being impermanent, subject to destruction.

Kabala.m kariiyatiiti kaba.liikaaro.

It is made into morsels and thus it is morsel-made (food).

Aaharatiiti aahaaro.

It produces and thus it is food.

Eva.m taava upaadaayaruupa.m saddatthato veditabba.m.

Thus one should understand the derived material phenomena in as far as it concerns their word meaning.

English:

The body, with its nature of bodily agitation, and the intimation which makes known an intention, is thus bodily intimation.

Speech with its nature of agitation of the voice, and this intimation which makes known an intention, is thus verbal intimation.

It is space, because it cannot be broken up, it cannot be ploughed *; it is not possible to plough it or to break it, or it does not appear, and thus, one does not enjoy what does not appear; what does not appear is space.

Then, because it is without a living soul, it is the element of space.

As to the expression (lightness) of matter, of produced matter. The nature of being light is lightness.

Because in itself it is unproduced, it is explained as “of matter.” This method applies for the remaining qualities **.

This is being wieldy for different works, its nature is wieldiness.

The first and the later accumulation is the occurrence, integration.***

Because of what precedes and follows there are connections, it goes on, proceeds as continuation.

Impermanence is the nature of being impermanent, subject to destruction.

It produces and thus it is food.

Thus one should understand the derived material phenomena in as far as it concerns their word meaning.

* There is a word association of aakaasa, space and kassati, to plough.

Another word derivation, according to Ledi Sayadaw: kaasati: to shine, to appear.

** These are different qualities or characteristics of matter, ruupa: lightness of matter, malleability of matter, wieldiness of matter are matter as alteration. They are unproduced, not concrete matter.

Growth of matter, continuity of matter, ageing of matter, impermanence of matter are characteristics of matter.

*** This refers to the origin or arising of rupa.

Vis. 37:

37. 1. Herein, the eye's characteristic is sensitivity of primary elements that is ready for the impact of visible data; or its characteristic is sensitivity of primary elements originated by kamma sourcing from desire to see. Its function is to pick up [an object] among visible data. It is manifested as the footing of eye-consciousness. Its proximate cause is primary elements born of kamma sourcing from desire to see.

37. tattha ruupaabhighaataarahatappasaadalakkha.na.m
da.t.thukaamataanidaanakammasamu.t.thaanabhuutappasaadalakkha.na.
m vaa cakkhu, ruupesu aavi~nchanarasa.m, cakkhuvi~n~naa.nassa
aadhaarabhaavapaccupa.t.thaana.m,
da.t.thukaamataanidaanakammajabhuutapada.t.thaana.m.

Tiika:

Note:

37. tattha ruupaabhighaataarahatappasaadalakkha.na.m
da.t.thukaamataanidaanakammasamu.t.thaanabhuutappasaadalakkha.na.
m vaa cakkhu,

N: impact of visible object, ruupaabhighaata, readiness or fitness, arahataa, the eyesense (sensitivity), pasaada. Then at end: characteristic, lakkha.na.m.

Sentient organ that is ready for the impact of visible data is the characteristic (of the eye). Pasada, literally brightness or clearness, (it is a revealer) is a derived rupa with its own specific nature or characteristic, (sabhava, own nature) also called pasaada-ruupa. It is eyesense, earsense, etc.

Now the second part, and for this I needed to consult the Atthasalini, 307 (Expositor II, p. 404). Vis reads: <or its characteristic is sensitivity of primary elements originated by kamma sourcing from desire to see. da.t.thukaamataanidaanakkammasamu.t.thaanabhootappasaadalakkha.na.m vaa>

I analyse: sourcing from desire to see, da.t.thukaamataa nidaana, originated by kamma, kammasamu.t.thaana, sentient organ depending on the primaries, bhootappasaada. At the end: characteristic, lakkha.na.m. In a compound stems are used and except at the end, no cases are used. Here bhoota stands for the genitive case, but in the compound the ending is eliminated. This will be clear from what follows.

In the Tiika it is said: catunna.m bhootaana.m pasaado : the sensitivity of the four primaries. The Atthasalini:<In the phrase 'that eye which is the sentient organ derived from the four great essentials,' the possessive case is used in the sense of purpose. The sentient organ arises grasping the four great essentials is the meaning.>

Thus we read the genitive: of the four primaries, but the meaning is: depending on.

Tiika text 37:

37. Idaani yathaa-uddi.t.thaani upaadaaruupaani lakkha.naadito niddisitu.m "tattha ruupaabhigaataarahabhootappasaadalakkha.nan"ti-aadi aaraddha.m.

Now he said first in order to explain the characteristics etc. of the derived material phenomena that were pointed out: " Herein, sentient organ that is ready for the impact of visible data is the characteristic and so on".

Tattha tatthaati tesu upaadaaruupesu.

As to the expression herein, this means, with regard to the derived materiality.

Ruupe, ruupassa vaa abhigaato ruupaabhigaato, ta.m arahatiiti ruupaabhigaataaraho,

On account of visible object, or the impact of visible object is visible object-impact, it is fit for this, thus, ready for impact of visible object,

ruupaabhigahaato hotu vaa maa vaa eva.msabhaavo catunna.m
bhuutaana.m pasaado ruupaabhigahaataarahabhuutappasaado,
the sentient organ that is dependent on the four primaries is of such nature,
no matter whether it is impinged on by visible object or not, thus, (there is
the compound) “the sentient organ dependent on the primaries that is
ready for the impact of visible data;

eva.mlakkha.na.m cakkhuuti attho.
thus is its characteristic, meaning the eye.
.....(section omitted)

Tenaaha “ya.m cakkhu anidassana.m sappa.tigha.m ruupamhi
sanidassanamhi sappa.tighamhi pa.tiha~n~ni vaa”ti,
Therefore he said: “...which eye that is invisible and reacting has impinged
on visible object that is visible and reacting...”

“yamhi cakkhumhi anidassanamhi sappa.tighamhi ruupa.m sanidassana.m
sappa.tigha.m pa.tiha~n~ni vaa pa.tiha~n~nati vaa”ti ca aadi.
“on which eye(sense) that is invisible and reacting visible object that is
visible and reacting has impinged or impinges...” and so on (Dhsg §598,
599).

.....(section omitted)

Da.t.thukaamataati hi da.t.thumicchaa, ruupata.nhaati attho.
As to the expression desire to see, this refers to seeing in the wrong way,
the meaning is craving for visible object.

(.....)

Ruupesu puggalassa, vi~n~naa.nassa vaa aavi~nchanarasa.m.
The picking up (an object) among visible data, by a person or
consciousness, is its function *.

Aadhaarabhaavapaccupa.t.thaana.m nissayapaccayabhaavato.
It is manifested as the footing of eye-consciousness, by its nature of
dependence-condition **.

Da.t.thukaamataanidaanakkammajabhūtapada.t.thaana.m

Its proximate cause is primary elements born of kamma sourcing from desire to see,

yesa.m bhūtaana.m pasaado, tevassa aasannakaara.nanti katvaa.

and the sense-organ is depending on (of) these primaries, which have been made the near cause of it.

English:

Now he said first in order to explain the characteristics etc. of the derived material phenomena that were pointed out: "Herein, sentient organ that is ready for the impact of visible data is the characteristic and so on".

As to the expression herein, this means, with regard to the derived materiality.

On account of visible object, or the impact of visible object is visible object-impact, it is fit for this, thus, ready for impact of visible object, the sentient organ that is dependent on the four primaries is of such nature, no matter whether it is impinged on by visible object or not, thus, (there is the compound) "the sentient organ dependent on the primaries that is ready for the impact of visible data"; thus is its characteristic, meaning the eye.

.....(section omitted)

...Therefore he said: which eye that is invisible and reacting has impinged on visible object that is visible and reacting...

on which eye(sense) that is invisible and reacting visible object that is visible and reacting has impinged or impinges..." and so on (Dhsg §598, 599).

.....(section omitted)

As to the expression desire to see, this refers to seeing in the wrong way, the meaning is craving for visible object.

(.....)

The picking up (an object) among visible data, by a person or consciousness, is its function *.

It is manifested as the footing of eye-consciousness, by its nature of dependence-condition **.

Its proximate cause is primary elements born of kamma sourcing from desire to see, and the sense-organ is depending on (of) these primaries, which have been made the near cause of it.

* The eyesense does not strictly speaking select or pick up an object. Because of conditions, citta does, or, in conventional sense a person does.

** The sense-bases and the heart-base are dependance-condition for the relevant cittas that arise at those bases.

Tiika Texts 37, part 2, fragments (see Vis. note 14):

.....

Etthaahañ cakkhaadiina.m indriyaana.m ki.m ekakammunaa uppatti,
udaahu naanaakammunaati? Ubhayathaapiiti poraa.naa.

'Here it may be asked, "Is the arising of the faculties of the eye, etc., due to kamma that is one or to kamma that is different?" Now the ancients say, "In both ways".

Tattha naanaakammunaa taava uppattiya.m cakkhaadiina.m visese
vattabba.m natthi kaara.nassa bhinnattaa.

Herein, firstly, in the case of the arising of an eye, etc., due to kamma that is different there is nothing to be explained since the cause is divided up.

Ekakammunaa pana uppattiya.m katha.m nesa.m visesoti? Kaara.nassa
bhinnattaa eva.

But when their arising is due to kamma that is one, how does there come to be differentiation among them? It is due to dividedness in the cause too.

Ta.mta.mbhavapatthanaabhuutaa hi ta.nhaa
ta.mta.mbhavapariyaapannaayatanaabhilaasataaya saya.m vicittaruupaa
upanissayabhaavena ta.mta.mbhavanibbattakakammassa vicittabhedata.m
vidahati.

For it is craving, in the form of longing for this or that kind of becoming that,

itself having specific forms owing to hankering after the sense-bases included in some kind of becoming or other, contrives, acting as decisive-support, the specific divisions in the kamma that generates such a kind of becoming.

Yato tadaahitavisesa.m ta.m

tathaaruupasamatthataayogenaanekaruupaapanna.m viya aneka.m
visi.t.thasabhaava.m phala.m nibbatteti.

As soon as the kamma has acquired the differentiation induced by that [hankering] it generates that effort consisting in appropriate ability, a multiple fruit with differentiated essences, as though it had itself taken on a multiple form.

Aya~nca ekassapi kammassa anekindriyahetutaavisesayogo yuttito,
aagamanato ca parato aagamissati.

And the fact of this differentiating effort on the part of kamma that is one being the cause of the multiple faculties will be dealt with below as to logic and texts.

Apica ekasseva kusalacittassa so.lasaadivipaakacittanibbattihetutaa
vuccati.

Besides, it is told how one kind of consciousness only is the cause of the generation of sixteen kinds of resultant consciousness and so on;

Lokepi ekasseva saalibijassa paripu.n.naaparipu.n.nata.n.dula-
aata.n.dulaphalanibbattihetutaa dissateva, ki.m vaa etaaya yutticintaaya.
and in the world it is also found that a single paddy seed is the cause of the generation of the ripe, the unripe, the husked, and the unhusked fruit. But what is the use of logical thinking?

Yato kammaphala.m cakkhaadiini, kammavipaako ca sabbaso
buddhaana.myeva ~naa.nassa visayoti.

For the eye, etc., are the fruit of kamma; and kamma-result is exclusively the province of a Buddha's knowledge' (Pm.444).

"The Path of Purification" (Visuddhimagga) Ch. XIV

38. 2. The ear's characteristic is sensitivity of primary elements that is ready for the impact of sounds; or its characteristic is sensitivity of primary elements originated by kamma sourcing from desire to hear. Its function is to pick up [an object] among sounds. It is manifested as the footing of ear-consciousness. Its proximate cause is primary elements born of kamma sourcing from desire to hear.

39. 3. The nose's characteristic is sensitivity of primary elements that is ready for the impact of odours; or its characteristic is sensitivity of primary elements originated by kamma sourcing from desire to smell. Its function is to pick up [an object] among odours. It is manifested as the footing of nose-consciousness. Its proximate cause is primary elements sourcing from desire to smell.

40. 4. The tongue's characteristic is sensitivity of primary elements that is ready for the impact of flavours; or its characteristic is sensitivity of primary elements originated by kamma sourcing from desire to taste. Its function is to pick up [an object] among flavours. It is manifested as the footing of tongue-consciousness. Its proximate cause is primary elements born of kamma sourcing from desire to taste.

41. 5. The body's characteristic is sensitivity of primary elements that is ready for the impact of tangible data; or its characteristic is sensitivity of primary elements originated by kamma sourcing from desire to touch. Its function is to pick up [an object] among tangible data. It is manifested as the footing of body-consciousness. Its proximate cause is primary elements born of kamma sourcing from desire to touch.

42. Some,(16) however, say that the eye is sensitivity of primary elements that have fire in excess, and that the ear, nose, and tongue are sensitivity of primary elements that have [respectively] air, earth, and water in excess, and that the body is that of all [four equally].

Others say that the eye is sensitivity of those that have fire in excess, and that the ear, nose, tongue, and body are [sensitivity] of those that have [respectively] aperture, air, water, and earth in excess. They should be asked to quote a sutta. They will certainly not find one.

(16) ' "Some" are certain Mahasanghikas; for among these Vasudhamma says

this: "In the eye fire is in excess; in the ear, air; in the nose, earth; in the tongue, water; in the body all are equal" ' (Pm.444).

"The Path of Purification" (Visuddhimagga) Ch. XIV

43. But some give as their reason that it is because these [several sensitivities] are [respectively] aided by visible data, etc., as qualities of fire, and so on.(17) They should be asked, 'But who has said that visible data, etc., are qualities of fire and so on? [445] For it is not possible to say of primary elements, which remain always inseparable,(18) that "This is a quality of this one, that is a quality of that one" '.

(17) ' "As qualities of fire, and so on": [aided] by visible data as the illuminating [quality] of heat, which is called lighting up; by sound [as a quality] of air, by odour [as a quality] of earth, by flavour [as a quality] of water called spittle--so according to the first theory [that of "others"] because they need to be assisted by such and such qualities of primaries: what is meant is that they have to be helped in apprehending visible data and so on. This theory holds that the quality is the ability of the eye, etc., to light up [respectively] visible data, etc., only when associated with the reasons that are their accessories consisting of light, etc., and aperture's state of decisive support for ear consciousness. Aperture is taken in due order, as are fire, etc., since it is absence of primaries. Or alternatively, when others intend that aperture is a quality of primaries, as visible data, etc., are, then the qualities of primaries are construable in their

order thus: [aided] by visible data and light [as a quality] of fire, by sound [as a quality] of aperture called space, by odour [as a quality] of air, by flavour [as a quality] of water, by tangible data [as a quality] of earth' (Pm.445).

(18) The four primaries are held to be inseparable and not to exist separate from each other; cf. quotation from the 'Ancients' in par.45. Pm. says: 'Excess is in capability, not in quantity, otherwise their inseparability would be illogical' (Pm.451).

Vis

"The Path of Purification" (Visuddhimagga) Ch. XIV

44. Then they may say: 'Just as you assume, from excess of some primary element in such and such material things, the [respective] functions of upholding (sandhaara.na), etc., for earth, etc., so from finding visibility, etc., [respectively] in a state of excess(19) in material things that have fire in excess, one may assume that visible data, etc., are [respectively] qualities of these'. They should be told: 'We might assume it if there were more odour in cotton, which has earth in excess, than in fermented liquor, which has water in excess, and if the colour of cold water were weaker than the colour of hot water, which has heat in excess.

45. 'But since neither of these is a fact, you should therefore give up conjecturing the difference to be in the supporting primary elements. Just as the natures of visible objects, etc., are dissimilar from each other though there is no difference in the primaries that form a single group, so too are eye-sensitivity, etc., though no other cause of their difference exists'.(20) This is how it should be taken.

But what is it that is not common to them all?(21) It is the kamma itself that is the reason for their difference. Therefore their difference is due to difference of kamma, not to difference of primary elements; for if there were difference of primary elements,

sensitivity itself would not arise, since the Ancients have said: 'Sensitivity is of those that are equal, not of those that are unequal'.

(19) ' "From finding visibility, etc., [respectively] in a state of excess": from finding them associated with these differences, namely, the bright visible datum in fire, sound audible through its individual essence in air, the odour beginning with surabhi perfume in earth, and the sweet taste of water; thus "visible data, etc., are the [respective] qualities of these". This is according to the first theory, and he has stated the conclusion (uttara) that follows, beginning with "we might assume" in terms of that. The second is confuted in the same way. Or alternatively, "Then they may say", etc., can be taken as said emphasizing, in order to confute it, the theory of Kanada, which asserts that the eye, etc., are respectively made of fire, space, earth, water, and air, that have visible data, etc., as their respective qualities' (Pm.445).

(20) In the P.T.S. text and the Sinhalese Hewavitarne text the word "ekakalaape", 'that form a single group', occurs in this sentence but is not in the Harvard text.

(21)[tiika p 6] 'If there is no differentiation according to primaries, what then is the reason for the differentiation of the eye, and so on? Though the kamma that is produced by the longing for a selfhood (individual personality) with five sense-bases is one only, still it should be taken as called "not common to them all" and "difference of kamma" because it is the cause of the differentiation of the eye, and so on. For it is not a condition for the ear through the same particular difference through which it is a condition for the eye, since, if it were, it would then follow that there was no distinction between the faculties. Because of the words, "At the moment of rebirth-linking, exalted volition is a condition, as kamma condition,

for the kinds of materiality due to kamma performed"(P.tn.) IT MUST BE RECOGNIZED THAT A SINGLE VOLITION IS KAMMA CONDITION FOR ALL KINDS

OF MATERIALITY DUE TO KAMMA PERFORMED that come into existence at the moment of rebirth-linking. For if the volition were different, then, when there came to be the arising of the faculties, it would follow that the materiality due to kamma performed was generated by limited and exalted kamma. And rebirth-linking that is one is not generated by a plurality of kinds of kamma. Thus it is established that the arising of the plurality of the faculties is due to a single kamma' (Pm.446).

Vis. 47:

47. 1. There is what is called 'the eye' in the world. That looks like a blue lotus petal and is surrounded by black eyelashes and varied with dark and light circles. The "eye" [sensitivity as meant] here is to be found in the place in the middle of the black circle surrounded by the white circle in that [feature of the] eye with its accessories where there appears the image of the bodies of those who stand in front of it. It pervades the eye's seven layers like oil sprinkled on seven layers of cotton. It is assisted by the four primary elements whose [respective] functions are upholding, cohering, maturing, and moving, as a warrior prince is by the four nurses whose functions are holding, bathing, dressing, and fanning. It is consolidated by temperature, consciousness, and nutriment; it is maintained by life; it is furnished with colour, odour, flavour, etc. (see Ch. XVIII, par. 5); it is the size of a mere louse's head; and it duly serves both as physical basis and as door for eye-consciousness, and the rest [of the consciousness of the cognitive series]. [446]

48. And this is said by the General of the Dhamma:

'The sensitivity with which he sees a visible object is small and it is subtle too, no bigger than a louse's head'.

Vis. 47. cakkhu cettha yadeta.m loke
niilapakhumasamaaki.n.naka.nhasukkama.n.dalavicitta.m
niiluppaladalasannibha.m cakkhuuti vuccati. tassa sasambhaarakakkhuno
setama.n.dalaparikkhittassa ka.nhama.n.dalassa majjhe abhimukhe
.thitaana.m sariirasa.n.thaanuppattipadese sattasu picupa.talesu
aasittatela.m picupa.talaani viya satta akkhipa.talaanibyaapetvaa
dhaara.nanhaapanama.n.danabiijanakiccaahi catuui dhaatiihi
khattiyakumaaro viya
sandhaara.nabandhanaparipaacanasamudiira.nakiccaahi catuui
dhaatuui katuupakaara.m utucittaahaarehi upatthambhiyamaana.m
aayunaa anupaaliyamaana.m va.n.nagandharasaadiihi parivuta.m
pamaa.nato uukaasiramatta.m cakkhuvi~n~naa.naadiina.m yathaaraha.m
vatthudvaarabhaava.m saadhayamaana.m ti.t.thati.
48. vuttampi ceta.m dhammasenaapatinaa --

`yena cakkhupasaadena, ruupaani manupassati.
paritta.m sukhuma.m eta.m, uukaasirasamuupama"nti..

Words:

saadheti (saadhayamana): to accomplish.

byatireka: what is left, addition.

visesa: distinction, difference.

joteti: to explain

Sariira: body

sa.n.thaana (n): shape

desa, padesa: location.

ka.nha: black

ma.n.dala (n): circle

pa.tikkhipati : reject.

sneha (sunehi): oily liquid

akkhi : eye

pa.tala (n): lining, film, membrane

byaapeti (vyaapeti): pervade

aayu: life
va.n.na: colour
anupaaleti: maintain
parivaareti: surround
santati :continuity
samu.t.thaapaka: originating
upatthambheti: to support
kalaapa: group
Pamaa.na (n): size
uuka: louse
sira (m,n): head
matta: of the size of
aavasaanaa: abode
samavasaraati : to meet

Tiika: 47, 48:

Pubbe lakkha.naadinaa vibhaavitampi cakkhu.m .thita.t.thaanaadito
vibhaavetu.m “cakkhu cetthaa”ti-aadi aaraddha.m.

He said first, “and there is here an eye”, in order to explain the eye as standing in its location and so on, after he had also before explained about its characteristic and so on.

Tattha cakkhu saadhayamaana.m ti.t.thatiiti sambandho.

Here the connection is, as said, the eye stands accomplishing (its functions of base and door).

Ca-kaaro byatirekattho, tenassa vuccamaanameva visesa.m joteti.

By the word “and” there is an additional meaning, he explains its diversity by saying this.

Etthaati etesu yathanidhi.t.thesu pa~ncasu upaadaaruupesu.

As to the word here, this means with these five derived material phenomena as explained *.

”Sariirasa.n.thaanuppattidese”ti etena avasesa.m ka.nhama.n.dala.m
pa.tikkhipati.

As to the expression, the point where the images of the bodies appear, by this he rejects that the black circle is remaining.

Snehamiva satta akkhipa.talaani byaapetvaa .thitaaheva attano
nissayabhuutaahi catuuhi dhaatuuhi katuupakaara.m

Just like an oily liquid it (the eyesense) pervades the seven layers of the eye, and it stands by itself, assisted by the four great elements on which it depends,

tannissiteheva aayuva.n.naadihi anupaalita.m parivaarita.m
and it remains, maintained and protected by life, colour, and so on,

tisantatiruupasamu.t.thaapakehi utucittaahaarehi upatthambhiyamaana.m
ti.t.thati.

supported by the three origination factors in the continuity of materiality, that are heat, consciousness and nutrition.

Satta-akkhipa.talabyaapanavacaneneva cakkhussa
anekakalaapagatabhaava.m dasseti.

By the expression, pervading the seven layers of the eye, he teaches that the eye is connected with several groups of materiality.

Pamaa.nato uukaasiramattanti uukaasiramatte padese pavattanato
vutta.m.

As to the expression, with the seize of a louse head, this was said with regard to its procedure at a point that has only the seize of a louse head.

Cakkhuvi~n~naa.nassa vatthubhaava.m nissayabhaavato
aavajjanasampa.ticchanaadiina.m tadaaramma.naavasaanaana.m
dvaarabhaava.m samavasara.t.thaanato.

Its nature is being a base for seeing-consciousness by way of being its dependence, and being a doorway (also) for the adverting-consciousness,

the receiving-consciousness and so on, and the retention that dwell (on the object) in the sense of association **.

Ta.m paneta.m cakkhu adhi.t.thaanabhedato,
Thus this is the eye as to its fixed classification,

tatthaapi pacceka.m anekakalaapagatabhaavato
and there, taking part in several groups of materiality, it stands by itself,
anekampi samaana.m saama~n~naniddesena aavajjanaaya ekattaa,
and though it is also diverse in the general explanation, it is one in
adverting,

ekasmi.m kha.ne ekasseva ca kiccakarattaa eka.m katvaa vutta.m.
and since it performs one function at one moment, it is said to be one.

Evampi bahuusu kathamekasseva kiccakaratta.m.
Though it is also diverse, how is it only one in the performing of its
function?

Ya.m tattha visada.m hutvaa “ruupaabhighaataaraha.m”, ta.m
vi~n~naa.nassa nissayo hotiiti gahetabba.m.
As he has made clear, saying, “ready for impact of visible object”, it should
be taken as being thus the support for consciousness.

Pho.t.thabbaviseso viya kaayavi~n~naa.nassa aaramma.nabhaave.
Even as the variety of what is tangible is the object for body-consciousness
***.

48. Manupassatiiti ma-kaaro padasandhikaro, atha vaa manuuti macco.
As to the expression, he sees (a visible object), the prefix “ma” (of
manupassati) is an euphonic combination, or, “manu” means man.

English

He said first, “and there is here an eye”, in order to explain the eye as standing in its location and so on, after he had also before explained about its characteristic and so on.

Here the connection is, as said, the eye stands accomplishing (its functions of base and door).

By the word “and” there is an additional meaning, he explains its diversity by saying this.

As to the word here, this means with these five derived material phenomena as explained *.

As to the expression, the point where the images of the bodies appear, by this he rejects that the black circle is remaining.

Just like an oily liquid it (the eyesense) pervades the seven layers of the eye, and it stands by itself, assisted by the four great elements on which it depends,

and it remains, maintained and protected by life, colour, and so on, supported by the three origination factors in the continuity of materiality, that are heat, consciousness and nutrition.

By the expression, pervading the seven layers of the eye, he teaches that the eye is connected with several groups of materiality.

As to the expression, with the seize of a louse head, this was said with regard to its procedure at a point that has only the seize of a louse head.

Its nature is being a base for seeing-consciousness by way of being its dependence, and being a doorway (also) for the adverting-consciousness, the receiving-consciousness and so on, and the retention that dwell (on the object) in the sense of association **.

Thus this is the eye as to its fixed classification,

and there, taking part in several groups of materiality, it stands by itself, and though it is also diverse in the general explanation, it is one in adverting,

and since it performs one function at one moment, it is said to be one.

Though it is also diverse, how is it only one in the performing of its function?

As he has made clear, saying, “ready for impact of visible object”, it should be taken as being thus the support for consciousness.

Even as the variety of what is tangible is the object for body-consciousness

48: As to the expression, he sees (a visible object), the prefix “ma” (of manupassati) is an euphonic combination, or, “manu” means man.

*The eyedecad consists of ten rupas in one group: the four great elements, the eyesense, life-faculty, colour, odour, flavour and nutritive essence.

Thus, apart from eyesense there are five other derived ruupas.

** Eyesense is base and doorway for seeing-consciousness, and it is doorway for the other cittas in that process.

*** The body sensitivity is all over the body, but only at one point at a time there is impingement of tangible object, and only that point is base and doorway for body-consciousness. It is diverse, but also one under the aspect of receiving the impact of tangible object.

The eye consists of many groups of rupa, but only one rupa in a group is eyesense, arising and falling away. Kamma keeps on producing it. Also when there is no impingement of visible object, the eyedecad is arising and falling away. It is ready or fit for impact of visible object, and then it is the doorway for the eye-door process cittas, and also the base for seeing-consciousness.

op 08-12-2003 01:43 schreef LBIDD@webtv.net op LBIDD@webtv.net:

> "It pervades the eye's seven layers like oil sprinkled on seven layers

> of cotton."

> What's this all about? I assume "it" refers to eye sensitivity.

N:

Sneham/iva satta akkhi/pa.talaani /byaapetvaa

oil/like /seven/eye/ layers/ having pervaded/

Just like an oily liquid it (the eyesense) pervades the seven layers of the eye.

I compared with the paralel Expositor text (II, Ch III, p. 403), yes, it is the eye-sensitivity.

Please note: all this is not medical science, it is a simile!!! See the word -iva after sneham (oil): just like oil. Iva is like viya: used for a simile. The Expositor says, <Although the world perceives the eye as white, as [of a certain] bigness, extension, width, they do not know the real sentient eye, but only the physical basis thereof.>

That is why it is said: <And again, the eye of the flesh is twofold: viz., as compound organ and as sentient organ. >

Eyesense is a hidden reality, you cannot touch it. But it is there, arising and falling away. You know it is there, otherwise you could not see. (an unobserved rupa that is real all the same!)

As you will see in the Tika: <By the expression, pervading the seven layers of the eye, he teaches that the eye is connected with several groups of materiality.>

Why here the seven layers? Perhaps to indicate that what we take for eye are so many groups of rupa arising and falling away. The seven layers are not the eyesense, but closely connected with it, eyesense cannot arise in isolation.

You had a ? mark after louse head, why? It is only a simile. In fact, it is even smaller. The Tika explains: <As to the expression, with the seize of a louse head, this was said with regard to its procedure at a point that has only the seize of a louse head.>

Note: its procedure: at this very, very small point there is a lot going on: when it is the right time for kamma to produce seeing, there is eyesense that is ready to receive visible object, so that there can be seeing.

48: The General of the Dhamma, this is Sariputta.

Nina.

"The Path of Purification" (Visuddhimagga) Ch. XIV

49. 2. The ear [sensitivity] is to be found inside the [feature of the] ear-hole with its accessories in the place that is shaped like a finger-stall and surrounded by fine brown hairs. It is assisted by the elements in the way aforesaid. It is consolidated by temperature, consciousness, and nutriment; it is maintained by life; it is equipped with colour, etc.; and it duly serves both as physical basis and as door

for ear-consciousness, and the rest.

Pali: 49. sasambhaarasotabilassa anto tanutambalomaacite
a"ngulivedhakasa.n.thaane padese sota.m vuttappakaaraahi dhaatuuhi
katuupakaara.m utucittaahaarehi upatthambhiyamaana.m aayunaa
anupaaliyamaana.m va.n.naadiihi parivuta.m sotavi~n~naa.naadiina.m
yathaaraha.m vatthudvaarabhaava.m saadhayamaana.m ti.t.thati.

50. 3. The nose [sensitivity] is to be found inside [the feature of the] nose-hole with its accessories in the place shaped like a goat's hoof. It has assistance, consolidation, and maintenance in the way aforesaid; and it duly serves both as physical basis and as door for nose-consciousness, and the rest.

51. 4. The tongue [sensitivity] is to be found in the middle of the [feature of the] tongue with its accessories in the place shaped like a lotus petal tip. It has assistance, consolidation and maintenance in the way aforesaid; and it duly serves both as physical basis and as door for tongue-consciousness, and the rest.

52. 5. The body [sensitivity] is to be found everywhere, like a liquid that soaks a layer of cotton, in this physical body where there is matter that is clung to.²³ It has assistance, consolidation and maintenance in the way aforesaid too; and it duly serves both as physical basis and as door for body-consciousness, and the rest.

Note 23. Upaadi.n.na (also upaadi.n.naka) is pp. of upaadiyati (he clings), from which the noun upaadaana (clinging) also comes. Upaadi.n.na-(ka-) ruupa (clung-to matter) = kammaja-ruupa (kamma-born matter); see Dhs. par.653. It is vaguely renderable by 'organic or sentient or living matter'; technically, it is matter of the four primaries that is 'clung-to' (upaadi.n.na) or 'derived' (upaadaaya) by kamma. Generally taken as a purely Abhidhamma term (Dhs., p.1), it nevertheless occurs in the Suttas at M.i,185 in the same sense.

Tiika 49, relevant Vis passage:

49. The ear [sensitivity] is to be found inside the [feature of the] ear-hole with its accessories in the place that is shaped like a finger-stall and surrounded by fine brown hairs. It is assisted by the elements in the way aforesaid.

Tiika 49:

A"ngulivedhaka.m a"nguliiyaka.m.

A fingerstall is a finger ring.

Vis. 53:

53. Like snakes, crocodiles, birds, dogs, and jackals that gravitate to their own respective resorts, that is to say, ant-hills, water, space, villages, and charnal grounds, so the eye, etc., should be regarded as gravitating to their own respective resorts, that is to say, visible data, and so on (cf. DhsA. 314).

53.

vammikaudakaakaasagaamasivathikasa"nkhaatasagocaraninnaa viya ca ahisusumaarapakkhii kukkurasi"ngaalaaruupaadisagocaraninnaava ete cakkhaadayoti da.t.thabbaa.

Tiika 53:

words:

ajjhaasaya: hanging on, disposed to, desiring

visama: uneven

vammika: anthill

chidda (n): hole

abhirata: indulging in

sappo: snake

bila (n): hole

pakkhii : bird

gaama : village

abhirata: indulging in

kukkura: dog

aamakasusaana (n) : charnel ground

si"ngaalo: jackal

papa~nca: obsession.

Tiika text:

Visamajjhaasayataaya cakkhu vammikachiddaabhiratasappo viya,
The eye takes to what is uneven * like a snake that delights in a hollow of
an antshill,

bilajjhaasayataaya sota.m udakabilaabhiratakumbhiilo viya,
the ear takes to a cave** like a crocodile that delights in a cave in the
water,

aakaasajjhaasayataaya ghaana.m aja.taakaasaabhiratapakkhii viya,
the nose takes to space*** like a bird that delights in the sky,

gaamajjhaasayataaya jivhaa gaamaabhiratakukkuro viya,
the tongue takes to a “village” **** like a dog that delights in a village,

upaadinnakajjhaasayataaya kaayo aamakasusaanaabhiratasi"ngaalo viya
the body takes to what is “clung to” ***** like the jackal that delights in a
charnal ground,

passitabboti dassento “vammi..pe.. da.t.thabbaa”ti aaha.
and he taught that it should be seen thus with the words, “It should be seen
as the anthill, etc.”

Visamajjhaasayataa ca cakkhussa visamajjhaasaya.m viya hotiiti katvaa
vuttaa,
And the desire for the uneven was stated just as if there is desire of the eye
for what is uneven,

cakkhumato vaa puggalassa ajjhaasayavasena cakkhu visamajjhaasaya.m
da.t.thabba.m.
or because of the inclination of a person who has eyes the eye should be
seen as desire for the uneven.

Esa nayo sesesupi.

The remaining is according to the same method.

Sabbopi ca yathaavutto papa~nco sotaadiisupi yathaaraha.m veditabbo.

And all this should be seen, as stated, as an obsession, also with regard to the ear and so on, as is appropriate.

English:

The eye takes to what is uneven * like a snake that delights in a hollow of an antshill,

the ear takes to a cave** like a crocodile that delights in a cave in the water,

the nose takes to space*** like a bird that delights in the sky,

the tongue takes to a “village” **** like a dog that delights in a village,

the body takes to what is “clung to” ***** like the jackal that delights in a charnal ground,

and he taught that it should be seen thus with the words, “It should be seen as the anthill, etc.”

And the desire for the uneven was stated just as if there is desire of the eye for what is uneven,

or because of the inclination of a person who has eyes the eye should be seen as desire for the uneven.

The remaining is according to the same method.

And all this should be seen, as stated, as an obsession, also with regard to the ear and so on, as is appropriate.

* Expositor elaborates: A snake does not like swept places but wants a place of refuse, a lair of grass and leaves, an anthill. Thus, an uneven place. Evenso, <the eye does not delight in burnished, gilded walls, but delights in [surfaces] variegated with pictures and beautified with flowers and creepers>. Thus there is a great variety of visible object, and seeing sees it all.

** The cave: <So, too, [the sense of hearing] desires a 'den'; it entertains a wish for the cavity of the ear which is dependent on space. The space in the ear-cavity is the cause of hearing a sound. And open space also is operative when [a bhikkhu] is reciting within [a cave].> All these similes are used to teach the conditions necessary for the functioning of the senses so that the sense-cognitions can occur.

***<So the nose desires space, and has for object odour dependent on wind...> It is explained that cattle turn up their muzzles and breathe the wind, and no smell is experienced when breath is not inhaled. An example easy to understand.

****The tongue <desires 'a village' and has for object the taste dependent on the watery element.> Even when the bhikkhu who enters the village in the morning <is not able to discern the taste of dry food unwetted by saliva.> In the village he will receive almsfood. A simple example that the water element (saliva) has a function for tasting sense.

*****The bodysense is compared to a jackal who desires to be in a charnal ground where he can eat raw human flesh. Evenso the tactile sense desires matter grasped at (upadi.n.na), and takes tangible object dependent on the extension element (N:solidity or earth).

Remarks:

The commentaries use many similes to explain the senses. We should go deeper into these texts in order to understand the purpose of the similes and explanations. Otherwise we do not profit to the full from the texts. The eye is compared to <a blue lotus petal and is surrounded by black eyelashes and varied with dark and light circles> and it is not bigger than a louse head.

<The ear [sensitivity] is to be found inside the [feature of the] ear-hole with its accessories in the place that is shaped like a finger-stall and surrounded by fine brown hairs>.

<The nose [sensitivity] is to be found inside [the feature of the] nose-hole with its accessories in the place shaped like a goat'shoof.>

<The tongue [sensitivity] is to be found in the middle of the [feature of the] tongue with its accessories in the place shaped like a lotus petal tip.>

<The body [sensitivity] is to be found everywhere, like a liquid that soaks a layer of cotton, in this physical body where there is matter that is clung to.>

Louse head, goat's hoof, those are not attractive images. The Expositor (311) states as to the tongue: like the upper part of a torn lotus leaf. Not beautiful.

These similes help us to see the foulness of the body, one of the meditation subjects for all occasions. And what is the purpose of that meditation? To remind us that what we take for our beautiful body are only rupas that are non-self. To see the body in the body.

And this is repeated for each of the senses: < It has assistance, consolidation, and maintenance in the way aforesaid; and it duly serves both as physical basis and as door...> The rupas that are the senses arise in a group of rupas, they need the assistance of the other rupas in that group, they are conditioned. Also the similes about the anthill have as purpose: to explain the particular conditions for each of the senses.

The Expositor expands more and I added part of it in my footnotes. We have to take them in the right sense, they are very daily, simple reminders that can help us to understand them as just conditioned rupas.

The bodysense is compared to a jackal who desires to be in a charnal ground where he can eat raw human flesh. Evenso the tactile sense desires matter grasped at (upadi.n.na), and takes tangible object dependent on the extension element (N:solidity or earth). The Expositor explains <Internal and external extension is the cause of the tactile sense seizing the object>. It is also said that one does not know the hardness or softness of a bed without sitting down in it, and of fruits placed in the hand without pressing them. Very daily examples to remind us of the element of hardness, external and internal.

The bodysense is <like a liquid that soaks a layer of cotton, in this physical body where there is

matter that is clung to.> The bodysense is all over the body, and it is base at that point where there is impingement of tactile object. There can only be impingement at one point at a time.

As you will see, at the end of my Tiika translation it is said:

<And all this should be seen, as stated, as an obsession, also with regard to the ear and so on as is appropriate.>

The word papa~nca, obsession, is used to give us an extra stab with the goad. We are obsessed by sense impressions. Therefore understanding of dhammas has to be developed at this moment.

The Expositor clarifies the real purpose of all these similes and explanations by stating about the eyesense (308, 309):

<And this is visual element [N: eyesense]' refers to emptiness of essence, of entity....

'And this is a world,' refers to its transience, perishableness...

'And this is ocean'- because it cannot be filled>

We never have enough of seeing, we cannot be satisfied, it is like an ocean.

<'And this is an empty village,' refers to its being common to many and to the absence of a possessor.>

There is no owner who can exert control. It is empty of essence as we read.

Vis. 54. 6. As regards visible data, etc., which come next, a visible datum has the characteristic of impinging on the eye. Its function is to be the objective field of eye-consciousness. It is manifested as the resort of that too. Its proximate cause is the four great primaries. And all the [following] kinds of derived materiality are the same as this. Where there is a difference we shall mention it. This [visible datum] is of various kinds as 'blue, yellow' (Dhs.617) and so on.

Vis 54. tato paresu pana ruupaadiisu cakkhupa.tihananalakkha.na.m ruupa.m, cakkhuvi~n~naa.nassa visayabhaavarasa.m, tasseva gocarapaccupa.t.thaana.m, catumahaabhuutapada.t.thaana.m. yathaa ceta.m tathaa sabbaanipi upaadaaruupaani. yattha pana viseso atthi, tattha vakkhaama. tayida.m niila.m piitakantiaadivasena anekavidha.m.

Tiika 54.

words:

pa.tihanati: to strike

abhighaata (m): impact

visaya: object

gocara: objective field

a~n~natthabhaavo: elsewhere

caareti (caarita): to pasture, feed, to feast.

aavi: clear

yattha: where

aadike: to begin with.

Text:

Cakkhumhi, cakkhussa vaa pa.tihanana.m cakkhupa.tihanana.m,
The impingement on the eye or of the eye is eye-impingement,

ta.m lakkha.na.m etassaati cakkhupa.tihananalakkha.na.m.
this is its characteristic [of visible object] thus, the characteristic of
impingement on the eye.

Pa.tihanana~ncettha yathaavutto abhighaatova.
And here the impinging is, as said, just the impact.

Visayabhaavo aaramma.napaccayataa.
(Its function is) being the objective field, it is object-condition *.

Kaama.m saa eva gocarataa, tathaapi visayagocaraana.m aya.m viseso
ana~n~natthabhaavo,
Sense-object is just the objective field, and therein the diversity of visible
data is not to be found elsewhere,

tabbahulacaaritaa ca cakkhuvi~n~naa.nassa.
and it is an object of abundant relish for seeing-consciousness **.

Visayabhaave cassa ya.m vattabba.m, ta.m parato aavi bhavissati.
And what should be said of its being the objective field will become clear elsewhere.

Yattha pana kaayavi~n~natti-aadike.

Just as in the case of body-intimation to begin with ***.

English:

The impingement on the eye or of the eye, is eye-impingement, this is its characteristic [of visible object], thus, the characteristic of impingement on the eye.

And here the impinging is, as said, just the impact.

(Its function is) being the objective field, it is object-condition *.

Sense-object is just the objective field, and therein the diversity of visible data is not to be found elsewhere,

and it is an object of abundant relish for seeing-consciousness **.

And what should be said of its being the objective field will become clear elsewhere.

Just as in the case of body-intimation to begin with ***.

* Visible object is object-condition for seeing and for the other cittas in the eye-door process. Object-condition is an indispensable condition for the arising of cittas. Each citta must experience an object.

** Visible object is a sense object and it is in particular a condition for abundant enjoyment. As we read before: "It relishes (cakkhati), thus it is an eye (cakkhu)". This reminds us that we are greatly attached to visible object and that we go on thinking with attachment on account of what is seen, without end.

*** The Vis. text states that the following kinds of derived materiality (after visible object) are similar, but that it shall be mentioned where there is a difference. Body-intimation to begin with is different, it displays intention and this will become clearer later on.

Vis. 55. 7. Sound has the characteristic of impinging on the ear. Its function is to be the object of ear-consciousness. It is manifested as the resort of that too. It is of various kinds as 'drum sound, tabor sound' (Dhs.621) and so on.

56. 8. Odour has the characteristic of impinging on the nose. Its function is to be the object of nose-consciousness. It is manifested as the resort of that too. It is of various kinds as 'root odour, heartwood odour' (Dhs.625) and so on.

57. 9. Flavour has the characteristic of impinging on the tongue. Its function is to be the object of tongue-consciousness. It is manifested as the resort of that too. It is of various kinds as 'root flavour, trunk flavour' (Dhs.629) and so on.

Vis. :

58. 10. The feminity faculty has the female sex as its characteristic. Its function is to show that 'this is a female'. It is manifested as the reason for the mark, sign, work, and ways of the female (cf. Dhs. 633).

11. The masculinity faculty has the male sex as its characteristic. Its function is to show that 'this is a male'. It is manifested as the reason for the mark, sign, work, and ways of the male (cf. Dhs. 634).

Both these last are coextensive with the whole body, as body sensitivity is. But it does not follow that they have to be called either 'located in the space where body-sensitivity is located' or 'located in the space where that is not located'.

N: Sex-faculty conditions rupas all over the body, and it is compared to bodysense which is also all over the body except in some parts as hairs or nails. But: it is not exactly in the same way as bodysense, it is only a comparison.

Text: Like the natures of visible data, etc., these are not confoundable one with the other.

N: Visible object is distinct from sound, etc. Thus, femininity is distinct from masculinity. The reference to Yamaka in the footnote should be: X, Indriya Yamaka, where it is explained that these two faculties are distinct.

Pali Visuddhimagga: 58. itthibhaavalakkha.na.m itthindriya.m, itthiiti pakaasanarasa.m, itthili"nganimittakuttaakappaana.m kaara.nabhaavapaccupa.t.thaana.m. purisabhaavalakkha.na.m purisindriya.m, purisoti pakaasanarasa.m, purisali"nganimittakuttaakappaana.m kaara.nabhaavapaccupa.t.thaana.m. tadubhayampi kaayappasaado viya sakalasariira.m byaapakameva, na ca kaayapasaadena .thitokaase .thitanti vaa a.t.thitokaase .thitanti vaati vattabbata.m aapajjati, ruuparasaadayo viya a~n~nama~n~na.m sa"nkaro natthi.

Tiika 58

Words:

abhidhaana (n): appellation, name

itthi: woman.

nara: man

pakaaseti: to make known

sahita: accompanied by

santaana (n): continuum

Va.t.ta (n): circle, cycle.

va.t.ta.msataa: rounded shape.

avisada: is: visada: pure, clean, manifest.

hattha (m): hand

paada (n): foot

Thana (n): breast

ma.msa (n): flesh

massu (n): beard

kesa (m): hair

bandhana: dressing

vattha (n) : cloth.

dahara: child

li"nga: feature, attribute
nimitta: characteristic sign
kutta: work, occupation
kappa: ways, behaviour, deportment
kii.la: play
yathaasaka: each its own, respectively
yebhuyya: numerous
yebhuyyena: mostly

Itthiyaa bhaavo, "itthii"ti vaa bhavati etena citta.m, abhidhaana~ncaati
itthibhaavo,

The sex of a woman, or because of this her disposition is "woman", and it is
therefore named femininity,

ta.m lakkha.na.m etassaati itthibhaavalakkha.na.m.
this characteristic of her is thus the female sex.

Tato eva "itthii"ti ta.msahita.m santaana.m pakaasenta.m viya hotiiti vutta.m
"itthiiti pakaasanarasan"ti.

Therefore, the continuum that is accompanied by this makes as it were
known, "this is a female", and thus, it was said that it has the function to
show, "this is a female, not a male".

Va.t.ta.msataa avisadahatthapaadaaditaa ca itthili"nga.m.

The rounded shape and the frailty of hands, feets, and so on are the
features of a woman.

Thanama.msaavisadataa, nimmassudaa.thitaa, kesabandhana.m,
The pronounced form and delicacy of the breast, being without a beard and
so on, the dressing of the hairs,

vatthagga.na~nca "itthii"ti sa~njaananassa paccayabhaavato
itthinimitta.m.

and the way of wearing cloths, all these things are the characteristic mark
of a female by being a condition of making known that this is a woman.

Daharakaalepi suppakamusalakaadihi kii.laa, mattikatakkena
suttakantanaadi ca itthikutta.m, itthikiriyaati attho.

Also in youth girls play by winnowing, with pestles and so on, with clay and
by spinning and so on, and this is a feminine occupation, meaning,
feminine behaviour.

Avisada.t.thaanagamanaadiko aakaaro itthaakappo.

A woman's deportment is her refined way of standing and going, and so on.

Aparo nayo itthiina.m muttakara.na.m itthili"nga.m. Saraadhippaayaa
itthinimitta.m.

The feminine attribute as being the feminine parts is another method of
explanation. This has the meaning of the feminine characteristic mark.

Avisada.t.thaanagamananisajjaakhaadanabhojanaadikaa itthikutta.m.

A woman's behaviour is her more refined way of standing, going, sitting,
swallowing, eating, and so on.

Itthisa.n.thaana.m itthaakappo.

Feminine deportment is the continuum of a woman.

Imaani ca itthili"ngaadiini yathaasaka.m kammaadinaa paccayena
uppajjamaanaanipi

And now, since a woman's feature and so on also arise each due to its own
condition consisting in kamma and so on,

yebhuyyena itthindriyasahite eva santaane ta.mtadaakaaraani hutvaa
uppajjantiiti

they mostly do so as modes in a continuum accompanied by the feminine
faculty,

itthindriya.m tesa.m kaara.nanti katvaa vutta.m

and thus, having made the feminine faculty the reason for these, he said,

“itthili”nganimittakuttaakappaana.m kaara.nabhaavapaccupa.t.thaanan”ti.
“The manifestation is the reason for the mark, sign, occupation and ways of the female.”

English:

The sex of a woman, or because of this her disposition is “woman”, and it is therefore named femininity,

this characteristic of her is thus the female sex.

Therefore, the continuum that is accompanied by this makes as it were known, “this is a female”, and thus, it was said that it has the function to show, “this is a female, not a male”.

The rounded shape and the frailty of hands, feets, and so on are the features of a woman.

The pronounced form and delicacy of the breast, being without a beard and so on, the dressing of the hairs, and the way of wearing cloths, all these things are the characteristic mark of a female by being a condition of making known that this is a woman.

Also in youth girls play by winnowing, with pestles and so on, with clay and by spinning and so on, and this is a feminine occupation, meaning, feminine behaviour.

A woman’s deportment is her refined way of standing and going, and so on.

The feminine attribute as being the feminine parts is another method of explanation. This has the meaning of the feminine characteristic mark.

A woman’s behaviour is her more refined way of standing, going, sitting, swallowing, eating, and so on.

Feminine deportment is the continuum of a woman.

And now, since a woman’s feature and so on also arise each due to its own condition consisting in kamma and so on, they mostly do so as modes in a continuum accompanied by the feminine faculty, and thus, having made the feminine faculty the reason for these, he said,

“The manifestation is the reason for the mark, sign, occupation and ways of the female.”

Nina.

'Footnote:

'As regards the "mark of the female", etc., too, its "facultiness" is stated as predominance, in other words, as a state of cause, because the conditions for the modal matter (aakaara-ruupa) consisting of the mark of the female, etc., in a continuity accompanied by faculties do not arise otherwise, and because these kinds of materiality are a condition for apprehending the female.

N: Explanation: conditions for the modal matter: namely the different modes of feminine features, signs, occupation and deportment, as explained in the Tiika.

Note: But because the feminity faculty does not generate even the material instances in its own group or maintain or consolidate them, and because it does not so act for the material instances of other groups, it is therefore not called in the text faculty, presence, and non-disappearance conditions, as the life faculty is for the material instances of its group, and as nutriment is for the material instances in succeeding groups.

N: We have to remember that faculty, indriya, is a leader, but in its own field. Eyesense is a faculty, a leader, an important condition for seeing. I quote U.Narada, Guide to Conditional Relations, who explains that sex is a faculty, but not faculty-condition as classified in the Patthana:

<<The sex materiality of beings born in the sensuous plane arises at the nascent phase of rebirth-consciousness [N: it is one of the three decads produced by kamma at the arising moment of rebirth-consciousness] . But the distinctive qualities do not appear simultaneously at that time. Now, a conditioning state of faculty-condition is always that of presence condition [N: it has to arise at the same time] and, accordingly, the conditioning and conditioned states must arise together either at the nascent or static phase [the moment of arising or of presence; also rupa has a moment of arising, moments of presence and a moment of falling away]. As pointed out above, the distinctive sexual characteristics do not arise together with the sex materiality and, therefore, the latter cannot be a conditioning state of presence condition [N: one of the classes of conditions in the Patthana]. As

such it cannot be that of faculty condition which controls those characteristics. Furthermore, sex materiality is not capable of controlling either the nine states of materiality that arise together with it in a materiality group (male- or female-decad) or the states of materiality belonging to another materiality group....

Why the two sex materialities are themselves faculties: The male and female sex materialities have their own independent power to bring about the bodily form and other distinctive characteristics of a man or woman respectively, and because of this control or domination they are faculties.> end quote.

The Expositor (II, 321) uses a simile:

<But feminine features, etc., are not the female controlling faculty; they are produced in course of process because of that faculty. When there is seed the tree grows because of the seed, and is replete with branch and twig and stands filling the sky; so when there is the feminine controlling faculty called femininity, feminine features, etc., come to be. The feminine controlling faculty should be regarded as the seed; as the tree stands growing and filling the sky because of the seed, so the feminine features, etc., arise in course of procedure because of that faculty.>

Footnote: And it is because the mark, etc., are dependent on other conditions that wherever they have predominance its shape is encountered, even in dead and sculptured matter that resembles it. And so too with the masculinity faculty.

'And since these two do not occur together in a single continuity, because of the words "Does the masculinity faculty arise in one in whom the femininity faculty arises? -- No" (Yamaka), etc., therefore even in a hermaphrodite there is only one of them at a given moment (see also DhsA. 323)' (Pm.448).

Vis. 59: 12. The life faculty has the characteristic of maintaining conascent kinds of matter. Its function is to make them occur. It is manifested in the establishing of their presence. Its proximate cause is primary elements that are to be sustained. And although it has the capacity

consisting in the characteristic of maintaining, etc., yet it only maintains conascent kinds of matter at the moment of presence, as water does lotuses and so on. Though states (dhamma) arise due to their own conditions, it maintains them, as a wet-nurse does a prince. And it occurs itself only through its connexion with the states that occur, like a pilot; it does not cause occurrence after dissolution, because of its own absence and that of what has to be made to occur. It does not prolong presence at the moment of dissolution because it is itself dissolving, like the flame of a lamp when the wick and the oil are getting used up. But it must not be regarded as destitute of power to maintain, make occur, and make present, because it does accomplish each of these functions at the moment stated (cf. Dhs. 635).

59. saharuupaananupaanalakkha.na.m jiiivitindriya.m, tesa.m pavattanarasa.m, tesa~n~neva .thapanapaccupa.t.thaana.m, yaapayitabbabhuutapada.t.thaana.m. santepi ca anupaalanalakkha.naadimhi vidhaane atthikkha.neyeva ta.m saharuupaani anupaaleti udaka.m viya uppalaadiini. yathaasaka.m paccayuppannepi ca dhamme paaleti dhaati viya kumaara.m. saya.m pavattitadhammasambandheneva ca pavattati niyaamako viya. na bha"ngato uddha.m pavattati, attano ca pavattayitabbaana~nca abhaavaa. na bha"ngakkha.ne.thapeti, saya.m bhijjamaanattaa. khiiyamaano viya va.t.tisneho diipasikha.m. na ca anupaalanapavattana.t.thapanaanubhaavavirahita.m, yathaavuttakkha.ne tassa tassa saadhanatoti da.t.thabba.m.

Tiika:

words:

anupaalati: to maintain

pavattati: to occur,

yaapati: to keep going

yaapeti: to support

thapeti: to establish, maintain

uppala (n): lotus

.thiti: establishment, persistence
sabbakaala.m: always

439. Sahajaruupaanupaalanalakkha.nanti attanaa sahajaataruupaana.m
anupaalanalakkha.na.m.

As to the expression, the characteristic of maintaining conscent kinds of
matter,

this means the characteristic of maintaining as if it were its own the
conscent materiality.

.....(follows footnote 25.)

Tesanti sahajaruupaana.m.

As to the expression (its function is causing the occurrence) <of them>,
namely, of the conscent materiality.

Pavattana.m yaapana.m. thapana.m .thitihetutaa.

By causing them to occur, to support them and establish them. By being
the cause of their establishment.

Attanaa anupaalanavasena yaapetabbaani pavattetabbaani bhuutaani
etassa pada.t.thaananti

The primary elements that are to be supported and made to occur because
it maintains them as if they were its own, are its proximate cause,

yaapayitabbabhuutapada.t.thaana.m.

and thus, its proximate cause is primary elements that are to be sustained.

Anupaalanalakkha.naadimhiiti aadi-saddena pavattanarasaadimeva
sa"nga.nhaati.

As to the expression, (the capacity consisting) in the characteristic of
maintaining and so on, with the words, <and so on>, he combines (its
characteristic) together with its function of making them occur.

Atthikkha.neyevaati anupaaletabbaana.m atthikkha.neyeva.

As to the words, only at the moment of presence, this means, only at the moment of presence of the material phenomena that are to be maintained.

Asati anupaaletabbe uppalaadimhi ki.m udaka.m anupaaleyya.

If there is no lotus that has to be protected, what would the water protect? *

Yadi kammajaana.m .thitihetumantarena .thiti na hoti, jiivitindriyassa ko .thitihetuuti aaha "sayan"ti-aadi.

If there is nothing that causes the persistence of the kamma-born materiality meanwhile, who would cause the persistence of the life-faculty, and thus he said, "it occurs itself and so on (only through its connexion with the states that occur)".

Yadi kammajaana.m .thaana.m jiivitindriyapa.tibaddha.m,

If the status of the kamma-born materiality is dependent on the life-faculty,

atha kasmaa sabbakaala.m na .thapetiiti aaha "na bha"ngato"ti-aadi.

then how could it at all times cause their subsistence and thus, he said, (it does not cause occurrence) after the moment of dissolution.

Tassa tassa anupaalanaadikassa saadhanato.

Because accomplishes each of these functions of maintaining, and so on
**.

Ta.m saadhana~nca jiiivamaanataavisesassa paccayabhaavato.

And the accomplishment is being the condition for distinguishing what is living.

English:

As to the expression, the characteristic of maintaining conascent kinds of matter,

this means the characteristic of maintaining as if it were its own the conascent materiality.

.....(follows footnote 25.)

As to the expression (its function is causing the occurrence) <of them>, namely, of the conascent materiality.

By causing them to occur, to support them and establish them. By being the cause of their establishment.

The primary elements that are to be supported and made to occur because it maintains them as if they were its own, are its proximate cause, and thus, its proximate cause is primary elements that are to be sustained.

As to the expression, (the capacity consisting) in the characteristic of maintaining and so on, with the words, <and so on>, he combines (its characteristic) together with its function of making them occur.

As to the words, only at the moment of presence, this means, only at the moment of presence of the material phenomena that are to be maintained.

If there is no lotus that has to be protected, what would the water protect?
*

If there is nothing that causes the persistence of the kamma-born materiality meanwhile, who would cause the persistence of the life-faculty, and thus he said, “it occurs itself and so on (only through its connexion with the states that occur)”.

If the status of the kamma-born materiality is dependent on the life-faculty, then how could it at all times cause their subsistence and thus, he said, (it does not cause occurrence) after the moment of dissolution.

Because accomplishes each of these functions of maintaining, and so on
**.

And the accomplishment is being the condition for distinguishing what is living.

* Thus, both the kamma-born materiality and life-faculty have to be present.

** : As said in the Vis. passage: <But it must not be regarded as destitute of power to maintain, make occur, and make present, because it does accomplish each of these functions at the moment stated. >

(footnote 25)Indriyabaddharuupassa hi mataruupato kammajassa, tananubandhabhuutassa ca utusamu.t.thaanaadito jiivitindriyakato viseso,

na kevala.m kha.na.t.thitiyaa eva, pabandhaanupacchedassaapi
jiiivitindriya.m kaara.nanti da.t.thabba.m, itarathaa aayukkhayato mara.na.m
na yujjeyyaati.

note 25. 'Since the life faculty is itself entirely kamma-born it is established, by taking them as conascent, that the things to be protected by it are kamma-born too; this is why there is no inclusion of the term "kamma-born".

N: The rupas conascent with life faculty are in one group that originates from kamma. Thus there is no need to say that the other rupas that are conascent are also originating from kamma.

It maintains as if it were its own that kamma-born matter by being the cause of its occurrence even though only lasting for a moment; that is why it has the characteristic of maintaining conascent kinds of matter. For kamma alone is not competent to be the cause of kamma-born things' presence, as nutriment, etc., are of the nutriment-born.

N: Kamma is past kamma and is since long fallen away. But life-faculty maintains the other rupas in the group originated from kamma. U Narada: <It does not relate by the force of production>, thus, it is not the same as the way the factors of nutrition, heat and citta produce the other rupas in their respective groups. These rupas produced by them are compared to a child with the mother alive, <whereas kamma-produced matter which is maintained by physical life-faculty, is compared to the motherless child maintained by a wet-nurse.>

' "Because it does accomplish each of those functions": it does so because it is a condition for distinguishing what is living. For it is the life faculty that distinguishes matter that is bound up with faculties from dead matter, and kamma-born matter and what is bound up with that from matter that is temperature originated, and so on.

N: Kamma-born matter is not only different from dead matter but also from materiality produced by the three other factors of heat, nutrition, citta.

'And the life faculty must be regarded as the reason not only for presence during a moment but also for non-interruption of connexion; otherwise death as the termination of a life span would be illogical'

N: The groups of rupa with life-faculty fall away but they are replaced throughout life until death occurs.

Pm. 448).

We see that what is written here in the commentaries is entirely consistent with the suttas, just elaborating on the details.

MN 43, 22, The Greater Series of Questions and Answers, the Five Faculties, Nanamoli/Bodhi transl:

„Friend, as to these five faculties - that is, the eye faculty, the ear faculty, the nose faculty, the tongue faculty, and the body faculty - what do these five faculties stand in dependence on?%o

„Friend, as to these five faculties - that is, the eye faculty, the ear faculty, the nose faculty, the tongue faculty, and the body faculty - these five faculties stand in dependence on vitality.

[Note: MA identifies vitality (aayu) with the life faculty (jivvitindriya), which has the function of maintaining and vitalising the other material phenomena of the living body.]

„Friend, what does vitality stand in dependence on?%o

„Vitality stands in dependence on heat.%o

[Note: Heat (usmaa) is the kamma-born heat intrinsic to the living body.]

„Friend, what does heat stand in dependence on?%o

„Heat stands in dependence on vitality.%o

„Just now, friend, we understood the venerable Sariputta to have said:

Œvitality stands in dependence on heat,; and now we understand him to say:

Œheat stands in dependence on vitality., How should the meaning of these statements be regarded?‰

„In that case, friend, I shall give you a simile, for some wise men here understand the meaning of a statement by means of a simile. Just as when

an oil-lamp is burning, its radiance is seen in dependence on its flame and its flame is seen in dependence on its radiance; so, too, vitality stands in dependence on heat and heat stands in dependence on vitality.‰

In the next section on Vital Formations (aayusankhaaraa), which the MA (comy) clarifies as indicating vitality, i.e aayu or jiiivitindriya, it clarifies that these are not feelings and it is when the body is bereft of vitality, heat and consciousness that is is Œthen discarded and forsaken, left lying senseless like a log,. I think this section was quoted before, indicating the distinction between someone who is dead and one, who has entered upon the cessation of perception and feeling.,

The body we cling to so much, depends on this very vitality or life-force which can cease at any moment. Reflecting wisely, it can be a condition for calm or satipatthana right now.

Dear Larry, Dan, Howard and all,

Larry, I was so glad to receive your two-liners early morning before breakfast. I had missed them. But do not go too fast, my transl is not ready yet. A line by line business, I have to make the word list for the Pali lovers. Yes, it is my morning meditation. I am thinking of Dan's sympathetic mail about Abhidhamma meditation, <the Master's voice is never far way>, going straight to the heart. It is true, but we have to find this out for ourselves. You guys really inspire me to consider difficult points and to try to make them relevant for our life, like Howard's questions. I never knew this before I joined Internet and dsg.

When we read definitions of life faculty, or sex faculty, it seems that they are abstract, only concepts, and often ungraspable. They are rupas which are <far away>, not easy to penetrate, according to the Visuddhimagga. Let us consider the cause, kamma. Kamma aeons ago may have produced our rebirth-consciousness, it is really a mystery when we think of it. It is past kamma (from a former life) that keeps on producing life faculty, also at this moment. This faculty makes all the difference between dead matter and a living body. I went to the swimming pool and what a good place for meditation. We cling so much to being alive, to health, to being female or male. But these are only rupas produced by kamma. Kamma is past, but life-faculty has a special function to maintain the other rupas in the groups produced by kamma. These groups are all over the body. There are showers annex to the pool, and while we were standing there under the shower, a fellow swimmer talked to us about old friends in wheelchairs he had visited in homes for the aged. It could not be any better, reminders of old age. And I was considering life faculty. Our clinging to body, to health. And in the Abhidhamma, Book of Analysis Ch 7 there is that impressive list of objects of conceit (I mentioned before) and among these: <pride of health; pride of youth; pride of life;... pride of posture...> Even when we are not comparing there can be conceit: O no, I do not want to behave like an old person. Clinging to the importance of our body. The Abhidhamma is great in making the chains rattle.

The whole world is my meditation room, I do not need to sit. This is the meaning of what we read in the Co. to the Satipatthanasutta; the monk carries his meditation subject forwards and backwards, he does not let it go. He pauses to pay respect at the Cedi. I can pause to pay respect to the Master and show my gratefulness for the Abhidhamma. Lodewijk also had his meditation and he does not mind me telling you, it is such a daily example. He saw a good looking girl coming out of the pool and he realised how uncontrollable cittas are: first seeing, and then attachment to beautiful form. He immediately reflected on the latent tendencies. This shows how discussing Dhamma can be very beneficial and form conditions for right understanding. We had been so occupied yesterday with the latent

tendencies. An example that we should not run away from akusala but face it and understand it. We have to know all akusala in the end.

Next time I shall go into the good questions of both of you, Larry and Howard. They are partly overlapping. I try to add explanations to the footnote: compact and difficult language. I shall quote again texts I wrote to Howard before. Howard, the main difficulty is perhaps the fact that Abhidhammic notions seem to be mere concepts, and seem ungraspable. But it may help to think of kamma as the cause from which life-faculty originates. Kamma does not produce concepts, it produces rupas and vipakacittas, realities.

Thus the goal of all these details on rupas is detachment. We learn how it is all conditioned. The eye of the Master is never far away! We cannot catch life faculty as an object of awareness, but the study of it helps us to see that the body we cling to are just rupas produced by kamma, citta, temperature and nutrition. Many moments of clinging to the rupas of the body pass by unnoticed.

With sincere appreciation of your interest in the study of the Abhidhamma, and may we all see the relevance of understanding life-faculty,
Nina.

"The Path of Purification" (Visuddhimagga) Ch. XIV

60. 13. The heart-basis has the characteristic of being the (material) support for the mind-element and for the mind-consciousness-element. Its function is to observe them. It is manifested as the carrying of them. It is to be found in dependence on the blood, of the kind described in the treatise on the mindfulness of the body (Ch. VIII, 111), inside the heart. It is assisted by the primaries with their functions of upholding, etc.; it is consolidated by temperature, consciousness, and nutriment; it is maintained by life; and it serves as physical basis for the mind-element and the mind-consciousness-element, and for the states associated with them.[26]

Pali:

60. manodhaatumanovi~n~naa.nadhaatuuna.m nissayalakkha.na.m
hadayavatthu, taasa~n~neva dhaatuuna.m aadhaara.narasa.m,
ubbahanapaccupa.t.thaana.m. hadayassa anto kaayagataasatikathaaya.m
vuttappakaara.m lohita.m nissaaya sandhaara.naadikiccehi bhuutehi
katuupakaara.m utucittaahaarehi upatthambhiyamaana.m aayunaa
anupaaliyamaana.m manodhaatumanovi~n~naa.nadhaatuuna~nceva
ta.msampayuttadhammaana~nca vatthubhaava.m saadhayamaana.m
ti.t.thati.

Tiika:

Dear Larry and all,

elaborating:

op 06-01-2004 01:18 schreef LBIDD@webtv.net op LBIDD@webtv.net:

> "The Path of Purification" (Visuddhimagga) Ch. XIV

>

> 60. 13. The heart-basis has the characteristic of being the

> (material) support for the mind-element and for the

> mind-consciousness-element. Its function is to observe them.

N: to observe: the Pali has: aadhaarana: the meaning is: being a container, foundation, support, holding up. In the five khandha planes where there are nama and rupa, cittas need a physical base, foundation. They do not arise independently of the body. The five sense-cognitions have the sense bases as physical support, and all the other cittas, namely, mind-element and the mind-consciousness-element (see explanation in the other post) have as support what is called the heartbase, an infinitely tiny rupa arising and falling away.

Text: It is manifested as the carrying of them. It is to be found in dependence on

> the blood, of the kind described in the treatise on the mindfulness of

> the body (Ch. VIII, 111), inside the heart.

N: let us first look at the footnote :

text: Vism. VIII, 111. This is the heart flesh. As to colour, it is the colour

> of the back of a red-lotus petal. As to shape, it is the shape of a

> lotus bud with the outer petals removed and turned upside down; it is
> smooth outside, and inside it is like the interior of a kosataki (loofah
> gourd). In those who possess understanding it is a little expanded; in
> those without understanding it is still only a bud. Inside it there is a
> hollow the size of a punnaga seed's bed where half a pasata measure of
> blood is kept, with which as their support the mind element and
> mind-consciousness element occur.

N: We have to go back in time centuries and centuries. What was the intention of the commentators? To see the heartbase as not worth clinging to, not beautiful. It is only the tiniest element performing a function. The last sentence is the core: <with which as their support the mind element and mind-consciousness element occur.> The reality of that base is expressed by means of conventional terms to help people at that time to understand it correctly. We should not reject the terms used here, but consider what is really essential. Blood, inside the heart: we have to understand the rupa dhamma these words stand for. That is what really matters.

Returning to Tiika Text: It is assisted by the
> primaries with their functions of upholding, etc.

N: It arises from the first moment of life in a decad: the four Great Elements: solidity (earth) as a foundation, cohesion (water) as holding together (preventing falling apart of the conascent rupas), heat (fire) as maturing or maintaining and motion (wind) as distending (resilience).

Text: it is consolidated by temperature, consciousness, and nutriment; it is maintained by life;

N: So long as we are alive cittas arise, and each citta supports the previously arisen rupas.

U. Narada, Conditional Relations: postnascence condition:

< Mentality possesses such powerful force that, although it depends on the heart-base,(which is dependent on the blood inside the heart that is a very small part of the body), it is related to the matter produced by the four causes present in the whole body by postnascence condition.>

> it serves as physical basis for the mind-element and the
> mind-consciousness-element, and for the states associated with them.

Nutriment and life: nutriment is one of the eight inseparable rupas arising in each unit of rupa. Not mentioned here: flavour, odour and colour, included in these eight.

It is maintained by life: since heartbase is produced only by kamma, there has to be in that unit: life-faculty. As we saw: it maintains kamma produced matter, as a wetnurse.

Nina.

[26] footnote: Vism. VIII, 111. This is the heart flesh. As to colour, it is the colour

of the back of a red-lotus petal. As to shape, it is the shape of a lotus bud with the outer petals removed and turned upside down; it is smooth outside, and inside it is like the interior of a kosataki (loofah gourd). In those who possess understanding it is a little expanded; in those without understanding it is still only a bud. Inside it there is a hollow the size of a punnaga seed's bed where half a pasata measure of blood is kept, with which as their support the mind element and mind-consciousness element occur.

Footnote 2, to Vis 60:

"The Path of Purification" (Visuddhimagga) Ch. XIV, paragraph 60

Note 26. ' "The heart-basis ... the support for the mind-element and for the mind-consciousness element"; how is that to be known? (i) From scriptures and (ii) from logical reasoning.

'The scripture is this: "The materiality dependent on which the mind-element and mind-consciousness-element occur is a condition, as a support condition, for the mind-element and the mind-consciousness-element and what is associated therewith" (P.tn. 1,4). If that is so, why is it not mentioned in the Ruupaka.n.da of the Dhammasa.nga.ni (Dhs.583ff.)? Its not being mentioned there is for another reason. What is that? Non-inconsistency of the teaching. For while eye-consciousness, etc., have the eye, etc., as their respective

supports absolutely, mind-consciousness does not in the same way have the heart-basis as its support absolutely.

N 2 a:

N: Book of Analysis: Ch 3, Analysis of the Elements 184:

<Therein, what is mind-element? Immediately after the cessation of the eye-consciousness-element that has arisen there arises consciousness...[follow many aspects of citta, like mind-faculty, etc]... mind element> [N: receiving-consciousness]. And: <...also (at the time of) first advertence [N: adverting-consciousness] in all states there arises consciousness... mind element.>

Note the word: immediately after. No gap.

Further on : <Therein what is mind-consciousness element? Immediately after the cessation of the eye-consciousness that has arisen there arises mind-element; immediately after the cessation of mind element that has arisen there arises consciousness...mind-consciousness element.>

To recap: mind-consciousness element: all cittas, except the five sense-cognitions and the three kinds of cittas classified as mind-element. It includes cittas experiencing an object through six doors as well as door-freed cittas, cittas not arising in processes, namely, rebirth-consciousness, bhavanga-cittas, dying-consciousness.

In the above quoted text we see the usefulness of remembering mind-element and mind-consciousness element. Processes of cittas are dealt with also in the Book of Analysis.

Now about general principles to understand the way of reasoning two and a half milleniums of years back. We find reasons for the way of classifications: to help those who are capable of understanding and for the sake of the beauty of the teaching.

This is an argument that counts. Why? At that time the teachings were orally transmitted and rehearsed. The great harmony of arrangement helped to do so. That is why we see that sections are numbered as Ones, Twos (dyads), Threes etc. The whole book of Yamaka consists of dyads. We also see this principle in the Suttanta. It is important to see that there are different headings of arrangement, and that there is non-inconsistency as we read here. The Pali has: desanaabhedo: desanaa: teaching. Bhedo:

division or category. Thus literally: in accordance with the way of categorizing the teachings. An example: perception of impermanence: the word sa~n~naa is used here, anicca-sa~n~naa. The Co to Mahharaahuloovaadasutta explains that this is vipassana, but under the heading of perception or remembrance.

N: 2 b:

Elaboration on Tiika text:

And the teaching in the

material-basis dyad (vatthu-duka) is given by way of the material support thus, "There is matter that is the physical basis of eye-consciousness, there is matter that is not the physical basis of eye-consciousness" (Dhs. 585) and so on;

N: the eyebase (eyesense) is the physical basis of seeing-consciousness, it arises there. The same for the other sense bases, thus, there are five pairs.

<there is matter that is not the physical basis of eye-consciousness>: not all rupas are the basis for eye-consciousness.

Text: and if the dyads were stated by

way of what had the heart-basis absolutely as its support thus, "There is matter that is the physical basis of mind-consciousness" and so on, then the object dyads (aaramma.na-duka) do not fall into line: for one cannot say: "There is matter that is the object of mind-consciousness, there is matter that is not the object of mind-consciousness".

N: The Tiika deals here with the pairs of bases (vatthus) and of objects. In the Dhsg this is in the Matika, but the translator has left this out. All rupas can be the object of mind-consciousness, thus, one cannot say: "There is matter that is the object of mind-consciousness, there is matter that is not the object of mind-consciousness".

I want to add more about aayatanas, sensebases to clarify this. There are 6 inward ayatanas: the five senses and citta (mind-base, which is not the heartbase, but which includes all cittas). There are 6 outer ayatanas: the five sense objects and dhammaayatana, including cetasikas, subtle rupas and nibbana.

Heartbase is included in the subtle rupas. Thus, five inner and outer ayatans form pairs, but the heartbase itself does not form a pair with citta.

Text: So the

physical-basis dyads and object dyads being thus made inconsistent, the teaching would lack unity. That is why the heart-basis is not mentioned, not because it is unapprehendable. [to be continued]

N: I quote from the Co to the Yamaka (Abhidhamma):

<It is true that the Teacher did not teach all dhammas in all places, but he taught particular dhammas at a particular place depending on the beings he should guide so that they would attain enlightenment. >

Good to remember when one believes that there are inconsistencies.

Footnote, 3 a. Elaboration.

[Note 26. ' "The heart-basis ... the support for the mind-element and for the mind-consciousness element"; how is that to be known? (i) From scriptures and (ii) from logical reasoning.]

Text: (ii) But the logical reasoning should be understood in this way. In the five-constituent becoming, [that is, in the sense sphere and fine-material sphere,] these two elements [mind element and mind-consciousness element] have as their support produced (nipphanna) derived matter.

N: The heartbase is among the derived rupas, it is produced by kamma. The Commentator points out in the following paragraph which of the rupas do not qualify for being the heart-base, the support of the mind-element and the mind-consciousness element.

Text:

Herein, since the visible-data base, etc., and nutritive essence, are found to occur apart from what is bound up with faculties, to make them the support would be illogical.

N: colour, sound etc. and also nutritive essence (one of the eight inseparables) are also in what we call dead matter, in what is not a living body (bound up with the faculties).

Text:

And since these two elements are found in a continuity that is devoid of femininity and masculinity faculties [i.e. in the Brahmaa-world], to make them the

support would be illogical too.

N: These do not qualify, because in the rupa brahma planes there is no sex faculty, but there are these two elements.

Text: And in the case of the life faculty that

would have to have another function, so to make it the support would be illogical too. So it is the heart-basis that remains to be recognized as their support. For it is possible to say that these two elements have as their support produced derived matter, since existence is bound up with matter in the five-constituent becoming. Whatever has its existence bound up with matter is found to have as its support produced derived matter, as eye-consciousness-element does.

N: eye-consciousness-element has the eyebase as its support.

Text: And the distinction "in the five-constituent becoming" is made on account of the mind-consciousness-element; in the four-constituent becoming, [that is, the immaterial sphere,] there is no mind-element.

N: Because there are no sense-door processes of citta experiencing sense-objects. Thus also no mind-element: the adverting-consciousness, the first citta of a sense-door process which adverts to the sense object that has impinged on one of the senses, and the two types of receiving-consciousness, arising after the vipakacitta of the sense-cognitions.

Text: Does there not follow contradiction of the middle term (hetu) because of establishing faculties as their support? No; because that is disproved by what is

seen. For these two elements are not, as in the case of eye-consciousness, controlled by the slackness and keenness, etc., of their physical basis; and accordingly it is not said in the texts that they have the faculties as their condition. Hence their having faculties as their support, in other words, their being controlled by them, is

disproved.

N: Faculty, indriya: some are nama some are rupa. The five sense bases are rupa indriya: sense-faculties. They are controllers, leaders in their own field. Eyesense (cakkhuppasada ruupa) is a controller, but only in the field of seeing. Weakness or keenness influences the seeing. It conditions seeing by being its base (vatthu) and also by being a faculty. And also by pre-nascence: rupa is weak at its arising moment, and in order to control seeing it must have arisen before it. Thus we have this condition: by way of base-prenascence indriya.

The five sense-bases are doorways for the cittas experiencing the relevant sense-objects. Heartbase could never be a doorway. Thus, it is quite different from the sense-faculties. It could never be a condition for the two elements by way of base-prenascence indriya.

U Narada, p. 61:

Why heartbase is never a conditioning state:(as base-prenascence indriya)
As shown above, five of the six bases are the conditioning states of base-prenascence-faculty condition, but the remaining base, heart-base, is never so. The reasons for this are;

1. Heart-base arises before mind-element and mind-consciousness element which are dependent on it.

In this respect it is similar to the other five bases. But unlike them, the strength or weakness of the consciousness is not dependent on it. Because whether the heartbase is clear or not, mind-element and mind-consciousness element are not affected accordingly [N: but in the case of seeing, this is affected by it]. Thus heart-base does not control the consciousness dependent on it.

2. The five bases and the five corresponding sense-objects are respectively the receivers and impingers. But this is not so with heart-base and cognizable object. Instead, cognizable object impinges on the mind-door (life-continuum *) and appears in it. Hence, heart-base is not a door and so it can never be a conditioning state of base-prenascence-faculty condition.>

U. Narada, p. 175:

<Question. Why is it that the general term 'base' expounded in Pth. is specified as 'heart-base' by the Commentators when this is not mentioned anywhere in the Pali canon?

Answer: It is clear to many that eye-consciousness, etc. are dependent and based on eye-base, etc. But in the case of the material base in question, 'heart' is prefixed to it so that there will be no doubt as to which base is meant. For mind-element and mind-consciousness element are dependent on the material base which is situated within the heart and is, therefore, called 'heart-base'. Thus 'base' and 'heart-base' are one and the same.

* The bhavanga-citta arising immediately before the mind-door process begins with the mind-door adverting-consciousness, is the mind-door. It is the means by which the cittas of that process experience the object.

Note no. 4a to Heartbase:

Note 26 cont.:

4 a:

'Granted that these two elements [mind-element and mind-consciousness element] have as their support the derived matter consisting of the heart-basis, how is it to be known that it is kamma-originated, has an invariable function, and is to be found located in the heart? It may be said to be kamma-originated because, like the eye, it is the materiality of a physical basis;

N: Eyebase or the rupa that is eyesense is produced by kamma. Evenso for the other sense-organs.

Text: and because of that it has an invariable function;

N: The Pali uses pa.tiniyatakicca.m: kicca is function. Niyata: we have to think of something fixed, according to a fixed order (niyama). Eyebase always serves as physical base and door for seeing. This is fixed, invariable.

Text: because it is the materiality of a physical basis and because it is a support for consciousness, is the meaning.

N: Eyebase is rupa and a base or support for seeing. Evenso the heartbase: it is rupa and it is a support for mind-element and mind-consciousness element.

Text: It is known that its location is there because of the heart's exhaustion (khijjana) in one who thinks of anything, bringing it to mind intently and directing his whole mind to it' (Pm. 449-50).

N: Here the Tiika commentator wants to make understandable in conventional terms why the heart-base is the physical support of citta. (More about this later on. To be continued)

Note 4 b:

Now follows a part of the Tiika, not mentioned in this long footnote 26. It returns to the definition of the Vis. text:

<The heart-basis has the characteristic of being the (material) support for the mind-element and for the mind-consciousness-element. Its function is to observe them. It is manifested as the carrying of them..

Pali: manodhaatumanovi~n~naa.nadhaatuuna.m nissayalakkha.na.m hadayavatthu, taasa~n~neva dhaatuuna.m aadhaara.narasa.m, ubbahanapaccupa.t.thaana.m.

Tiika text: Taasa~n~neva dhaatuunanti (aadhaara.narasa.m)

As to the expression, of these elements (its function is observance),

manodhaatumanovi~n~naa.nadhaatuuna.myeva

namely, of the mind-element and the mind-consciousness element.

Nissayabhaavato upari aaropetvaa vahanta.m viya paccupati.t.thatiiti ubbahanapaccupa.t.thaana.m.

Because of its nature of support, it manifests itself by bearing them as it were after having lifted them up, and thus its manifestation is the carrying of them.

Sesa.m he.t.thaa vuttanayameva.

What remains has been spoken of above.

English:

As to the expression, of these elements (its function is observance), namely, of the mind-element and the mind-consciousness element. Because of its nature of support, it manifests itself by bearing them as it were after having lifted them up, and thus its manifestation is the carrying of them.

What remains has been spoken of above.

Last part of footnote 26 is not the Tiika text, but the translator's opinion. The word "hadaya" (heart), used in a purely mental and not physical sense, occurs in the definitions of the mind-element and mind-consciousness-element in the Vibha.nga (Vbh. 88-89).

N: yes, here it is mentioned as one of the many aspects of citta, like mind-base (citta, not the heartbase), of faculty of mind, citta as indriya, etc.

Text: The brain (matthalu.nga), which seems to have been first added as the 32nd part of the body in the Pa.tisambhidaa (Ps.i,7), was ignored, and the

Visuddhimagga is hard put to it to find a use for it.

N: They were not brain orientated.

Text: The Pi.takas (e.g.P.tn.1,4 quoted above) connect the mind with the matter of the body without specifying.

N: The Patthana mentions hear-base as : that rupa.

(will be continued, more about heart-base and heart.)

Note 26, 4 c

Follows after the footnote 26.

U. Narada gives examples trying to explain why the material base is located within the heart. He gives his personal views. When there is grief, <the heat caused by the anxious mind is transmitted to the heart's blood on which the base is dependent and thence to the heart...There are times when, because of deep and crushing grief, death occurs of a broken heart.>

He also explains about the brain: <The blood and the air that is breathed in are circulating within the body and so the blood of the heart also goes to the brain.

When there is great disappointment or displeasure the mind is inflamed with anger. So the heartbase, on which the mind depends, gets heated and also the heartblood. Then this hot blood and air also get to the brain which is thereby heated.>

N: He tries to explain the heart as centre, versus the brain theory, but mixing medical terms with realities may be confusing.

We have to remember that the heartbase is a subtle rupa to be known only through the mind-door. When we believe that we notice the heartbase through the bodysense, it is only thinking about the heart. We may cling to our heart instead of understanding the reality of the rupa that is heartbase. It is helpful that the Patthana only uses the term: that rupa.

This is the lesson we can learn.

U. Narada cites places of the Patthana where the heartbase occurs as dependence condition, at birth and throughout life.

At the moment of birth the heart-base arises simultaneously with the rebirth-consciousness, and during life, the arising of citta is dependent on the heartbase that arose together with the citta immediately preceding it.

We have to remember that rupa is weak at its arising moment and that it can only condition nama after it has arisen, during its moments of presence. Kamma keeps on producing the heartbase throughout life during the three moments of citta: its arising moment, the moment of its presence and the moment of its falling away.

At the time of dying, the last cittas depend on one heartbase. U Narada: < It is like many persons sitting astride an old man who is very weak. For the heart-base at the time of dying is very weak and many consciousnesses have to depend on it, and it ceases with the ceasing of death-consciousness. The simultaneous ceasing of this materiality with consciousness is known as birth. (Note that the simultaneous arising of this materiality with consciousness is known as birth in the five aggregates planes.) >

Heart-base can condition citta by: base-object- pre-nascent-dependence condition. It is pre-nascent, it is base, it can also be the object. In the Patthana it is explained that it can be the object of insight or of lobha: “ (One) practises insight into impermanency, suffering, impersonality...

enjoys and delights in the internal (heart-base). Taking it as object, arises lust, arises wrong views, arises doubt, arises restlessness, arises grief.” This shows that a rupa that can be experienced only through the mind-door is not only experienced by insight, but it can also be experienced by akusala citta.

U Narada, p. 33: during the process of dying: <In this condition [N: as object and base] it is this heart-base that is taken as object by all the dying impulses even if there is delight, grief, doubt or restlessness at the time.>

L: Even so, there is reason to doubt that this could happen.

N: We never know, it depends on conditions, we cannot speculate about this. Heartbase is a condition by way of base, and also it can be a condition by way of object at the same time, during life or at the end of life, as we have seen (U Narada, refers to Patthana). Some people find it hard to accept that what can only be experienced through the mind-door and what they cannot experience now is not necessarily a concept. Heartbase is a reality, a dhamma. A concept can be a condition by way of object, but it could never be a condition by way of base, as is the case with the heart-base. Thus, how could heartbase be a concept, an idea, a product of thinking?

L: I see that the Vism. commentary says the heartbase is to be known "from

> scriptures and from reasoning", in other words, conceptually.

N: I am glad you mention this. We have to return to the Pali text: <kathameta.m vi~n~naatabbanti? Aagamato, yuttito ca.>

How can this be known? aagamato: by the scriptures. Yuttito: by application. There is nothing about logical reasoning in the Pali text, this is too limited. Yutta: yoked, connected, applied to. You see here that this is a much larger meaning? Applied not just by thinking, it can be by direct experience. From the scriptures, yes, had the Buddha not taught us, we would not know that there is a heart-base. People may doubt again. Only the sotapanna has eradicated doubt. By the development of satipatthana he has realized by direct experience many realities. Suppose many are realized but not all, this does not give rise to doubt, because of the

confidence in the Dhamma has become unshakable. Because of direct experience through panna, confidence becomes steadfast and firm.

A Summary about heartbase:

Rob K's posts have rendered many questions people may have about the heart, transplantation of heart, etc. He also explained that we may be clinging to an idea of my heart, but that the heartbase is a very subtle rupa that can only be experienced through the mind-door. Although we cannot experience it now, what can we learn about this? It is the physical basis for many cittas, included in mind-element and mind-consciousness element. It is a condition for other realities and it itself is conditioned by kamma which keeps on producing it throughout life, on and on. We are in a five khandha plane, meaning, what we call *we* are nama and rupa. Each citta takes a new base (be it sensebase or heartbase), except during the last javanacittas of a life which all depend on one heartbase. This study helps us to see at least intellectually, that the heartbase and the cittas that depend on it are very temporary, beyond control and not to be taken for mine or self. All these studies of details we do now are accumulated as a foundation so that later on panna can arise which understands the true nature of dhammas.

Vis. 61.

14. Bodily intimation is the mode (conformation) and the alteration (deformation) in the consciousness-originated air element that causes the occurrence of moving forward, etc., which mode and alteration are a condition for the stiffening, upholding, and moving of the conascent material body. [448] Its function is to display intention. It is manifested as the cause of bodily excitement. Its proximate cause is the consciousness-originated air element. But it is called 'bodily intimation' (kaaya-vi~n~natti) because it is the cause of the intimating (vi~n~naapana) of intention by means of bodily excitement, and because it is itself intimatable through the body, in other words, through that bodily excitement. Moving forward, etc., should be understood to occur

owing to the movement of the [kinds of matter] that are temperature-born, etc., which are interlocked with the consciousness-born kinds moved by that [intimation].²⁷ (See Dhs. 636)

Pali:

abhikkamaadipavattakacittasamu.t.thaanavaayodhaatuyaa
sahajaruupakaayathambhanasandhaara.nacalanassa paccayo
aakaaravikaaro kaayavi~n~natti, adhippaayapakaasanarasaa,
kaayavipphandanahetubhaavapaccupa.t.thaanaa,
cittasamu.t.thaanavaayodhaatupada.t.thaanaa. saa panesaa
kaayavipphandanena adhippaayavi~n~naapanahetutta, saya~nca tena
kaayavipphandanasa"nkhaatena kaayena vi~n~neyyattaa
`kaayavi~n~nattii"ti vuccati. taaya ca pana calitehi cittajaruuphehi
abhisambandhaana.m utujaadiinampi calanato abhikkamaadayo
pavattantiiti veditabbaa.

Tiika:

441 Vis. 61. Abhikkamo aadi yesa.m te abhikkamaadii. Aadi-saddena
pa.tikkamasami~njanapasaara.na-ukkkhepana-avekkhepanaadikaa sabbaa
kiriya pariggayhati. Tesa.m abhikkamaadiina.m pavattaka.m citta.m
samu.t.thaana.m yassaa saa abhikkamaadippavattakacittasamu.t.thaanaa,
vaayodhaatu. Tassaa ya.m sahajaruupakaayassa
thambhanasandhaara.nacalanasa"nkhaata.m kicca.m, tassa
sahakaariikaara.nabhuuto aakaaraviseso kaayavi~n~natti naamaati
dassento aaha iabhikkamaadiÖpeÖ kaayavi~n~nattiîti.

note 1, (27):

Note 27. 'It is the mode and the alteration of what? Of consciousness-originated primary elements that have the air-element in excess of capability.

N: There is a certain unique change in the great Elements and the element of wind or motion (air) plays its specific part. By means of gestures or bodily movement certain intentions are displayed.

Text: What is that capability? It is the state of being consciousness-born and the state of being derived matter.

N: all rupas that are not the four Great Elements are derived rupas, and these depend on the four great Elements. Bodily intimation is originated by citta, not by kamma, temperature or nutrition.

Text: Or alternatively, it can be taken as the mode of alteration of the air element. If that is so, then intimation is illogical as derived matter, for there is no derived matter with a single primary as its support, since "matter derived from the four great primaries" (M.i,53) is said. That is not wrong. Alteration of one of the four is that of all four, as with wealth shared among four. And excess of air element in a material group (kalaapa) does not contradict the words "of the air element"; and excess is in capability, not in quantity, otherwise their inseparability would be illogical.

N: The four great Elements and also four other rupas (colour, odour, flavour and nutrition) form an octad, they are inseparable, always arising together. The excess of the element of wind or motion does not mean: there is more of it in that group, but it means: it plays its specific part in being capable of causing gestures etc. expressing a meaning.

Text: According to some it is that of the air element only. In their opinion the state of derived matter is inapplicable (durupapaada) to intimation, since the alteration of one is not that of all.

N: Some teachers have a different opinion.

Text: But this [air element] is apprehended by mind-door impulsion that is next to the non-intimating [apprehension] that is next to the apprehension of the appearance of motion in the movement of the hands, and so on.

N: When someone is intimating a meaning to someone else there are different moments of perceiving different objects. There is not immediately the noticing of the meaning displayed.

Text: There is a certain kind of alteration that is separate from the appearance of motion. And the apprehension of the former is next to the apprehension of the latter. How is that to be known? By the apprehension of intention.

N: Apprehension is the translation of gaha.na: grasping, taking up, apprehending.

Text: For no apprehension of intention such as "He is getting this done, it seems" is met with in the case of trees' movements, etc., which are devoid of intention.

N: Trees have no citta, no intention. Thus, bodily intimation is not merely motion, even trees move. But they have no intention to display a meaning.

Text: But it is met with in the case of hand movements and so on.

Therefore there is a certain kind of alteration that is separate from the appearance of known as the "intimator of the intention".

Also it is known by inference that the apprehension of the alteration is next to the apprehension of the appearance thus:

N: Processes of citta take their course and succeed one another very quickly. Seeing colour is one moment, afterwards there is remembrance of different moments of seeing which give the impression of movement of the hands, and after that the meaning displayed is known. If we take into consideration that six javana cittas cause the strengthening and supporting of the body but cannot move it, and that only the seventh sets up mobility which displays an intention, moving forward or backward, bending and extending the limbs, we can understand that this is known by inference. We cannot pinpoint exactly the seventh javanacitta that originates bodily intimation. Countless processes succeed one another, where all this occurs. The "Expositor"(I, p. 110) suggests <by repetition more than a thousand times>. We can imagine that it takes countless processes of citta to intimate a meaning and for the person or animal to understand the meaning.

Text: The intimator intimates the meaning to be intimated only when it is apprehended as a cause, not merely as present.

For they say accordingly:

Sounds that have entered no objective field do not awaken any kind of meaning; and also beings merely recognized as such communicate no meanings either.

N: The intimator should make known a meaning, the citta of the intimator is the cause of bodily intimation. This implies that bodily intimation does not

occur merely when one sees the outward appearance of a person who is standing or moving without intention to display a meaning.

Note 27, no 2:

"The Path of Purification" Ch. XIV, 61

[concerning bodily intimation]

Note 27 cont': Text: 'If just the apprehension of the alteration is the reason for the apprehension of the intention, why is there no apprehension of intention in unapprehended communication (sa.nketa)? It is not only just the apprehension of the alteration that is the reason for the apprehension of the intention; but rather it should be taken that the apprehension of the previously-established connexion is the decisive support for this.

N: The seventh javama-citta originates the intimation expressing a meaning, but, the previous six javana-cittas causing the strengthening and supporting of the body are the decisive support for the seventh one that originates intimation.

Text: The stiffening, upholding, and movement are due to the air element associated with the alteration belonging to the intimation, is what is said.

N: The alteration: the unique change (vikaara) in the great Elements is bodily intimation.

Text: What, is it all the air-element that does all those things? It is not like that. For it is the air-element given rise to by the seventh impulsion that, by acquiring as its reinforcing conditions the air elements given rise to by the preceding impulsions, moves consciousness-originated matter by acting as cause for its successive arisings in adjacent locations (desantaruppatti--cf. Ch. VIII, n.54), not the others.

N: "given rise to" translates sahita. I prefer belonging to, united with. The air element connected with, originated from the seventh impulsion (javana).

Its successive arisings in adjacent locations. Desantaruppatti: desa: location, antare: in between, uppatti: arising. Refers to Vis. VIII, n. 54: here it is explained that what is stated as a long breath actually consists of many rupas that are arising in adjacent locations. Each rupa (in this case the rupa that is breath produced by citta) falls away immediately, it could not stay and move on to another location. It only seems so.

Text: The others, however, help it by doing the stiffening and upholding, the successive arising in adjacent locations being itself the movement.

Text: So the instrumentality should be taken as attributed when there is the sign [of movement]; otherwise there would not be uninterestedness and momentariness of dhammas.

N: the Pali does not have instrumentality, this translation is not clear.
<Desantaruppatti eva calananti nimitte ca kattubhaavo samaaropitoti da.t.thabba.m. >

Kattubhaavo: the state of being an agent. It should be understood that the state of being an agent is effected (samaropito) by an image of motion, when there is arising in adjacent locations.

<A~n~nathaa dhammaana.m abyaapaarataa, kha.nikataa ca na siyaa. >
Otherwise there would not be uninterestedness and momentariness of dhammas.

N: There are only dhammas rolling on because of conditions, they are uninterested, they do not know anything. They are very momentary (kha.nika), they fall away immediately. It just seems that a coloured surface, that hands are moving, but in reality there are different dhammas arising in adjacent locations from moment to moment.

Text: And here the cart to be drawn by seven yokes is given as simile in the commentary.

N: Expositor I, p. 110: <As when a cart is drawn by seven yokes, the bullocks at the first yoke are able to bear the yoke but not to turn the wheels. And the same with the bullocks yoked to the second...and the sixth yokes. But by harnessing bullocks to a seventh yoke a clever driver sitting in the forepart of the cart takes the reins and urges the bullocks with the goad, beginning from the foremost of all; then all the bullocks being of

united strength steady the yoke, turn the wheels, draw the cart, enabling us to say that it has gone ten or twenty yoyanas. Thus the completeness of this process should be understood.>

Just before this passage the Expositor stated <Hence there results an act of going or coming or both; (by repetition more than a thousand times) it enables us to say that a man has gone a yoyana, gone as far as ten yoyanas . > It indicates that there are countless processes of citta occurring when there is motion and intimation.

Text: But when consciousness-born matter moves, the kinds of matter born of

temperature, kamma, and nutriment move too because they are bound up with it, like a piece of dry cow-dung thrown into a river's current.

N: The four factors that originate rupa all work together to cause motion. Just like a piece of cowdung that moves along with the river.

Nina.

N: It is the only rupa lasting for just one moment of citta. So very subtle and so very different from our ideas of what it is - a story about intimation or a traffic signal

There are seven javana citta, kusala citta or akusala citta in the process of citta, and six of them cause bodily tension or motion, but only the seventh javana citta is the cause of the rupa that is bodily intimation, and this rupa falls away with that citta. It is the only rupa lasting for just one moment of citta. It is hard to pinpoint, but we know it is the cause of gestures or facial expression which display a meaning or intention. In order to understand this rupa it is not helpful to think of a whole situation or story, such as: I type and then I make known a wish, etc. Then we shall not know that rupa. It is not a word or term, it is not theoretical, but it is rupa, it is an element, it is real. It is a very subtle rupa, arising and falling away with one moment of citta.

It can be directly known by insight, but it depends on whether it appears to the insight knowledge or not. Not all rupas have to be known by vipassana ~naa.na, but we should not say that it is impossible to know it.

Different processes of citta are dealt with that know objects through different doorways. Nama and rupa. Rupas produced by citta which has the intention to display a meaning. It is very daily, occurs all the time. But we forget that there are, in the absolute sense, just nama and rupa arising because of their appropriate conditions. When you speak and move your hands to emphasize your words, there is already bodily intimation. We take it for self! There can also be conceit on account of it. We attach importance to our gestures, to <my personality>.

Tiika: Note 27, no 3.

Text: 'Since it has been said that the apprehension of intimation is next to the apprehension of the appearance of motion, how then, is the air element itself as the maker of the movement accompanied by the alteration consisting in the intimation? It is not like that. It is the air elements given rise to by the first impulsion, etc., and which are unable to cause movement in that way and perform only the stiffening and upholding, that should be taken as only accompanied by the alteration belonging to intimation. For it is the alteration coexistent with the intention that is the intimation, because of giving rise to alteration in whatever direction it wishes to cause the occurrence of moving forward and so on. Taking it in this way, it is perfectly logical to say that the origination of intimation belongs to mind-door adverting.

N: Citta in a mind-door process that wish to display a meaning condition the rupa that is bodily intimation.

Text: Since the intention possessed of the aforesaid alteration is intimated through the apprehension of that alteration, it is said that "Its function is to display intention". The air element being the cause of the motion of the body intimation, is figuratively said, as a state of alteration, to be "manifested as the cause of bodily motion". "Its proximate cause is the consciousness-originated air-element" is said since the air element's excessive function is the cause of intimating intention by movement of the body' (Pm. 450-52). Cf. DhsA. 83f.

N: excessive function of the air-element: to recap the beginning of this note: The excess of the element of wind or motion does not mean: there is more of it in that group, but it means: it plays its specific part in being capable of causing gestures etc. expressing a meaning. Thus the excess is not quantitative.

The citta that conditions intimation arises in a mind-door process, and the citta that apprehends that intimation also arises in a mind-door process.

Quote from the Expositor (p. 111, 112):

<If anyone stands in the path of the eye, raises his hands or feet, shakes his head or brow, the movements of his hands, etc. are visible. Intimation, however, is not so visible; it is only knowable by mind. For one sees by the eye a colour-surface moving by virtue of the change of position in hands, etc. [N: different moments of seeing, but sa~n~naa marks and remembers] But by reflecting on it as intimation, one knows it by mind-door-consciousness, thus: 'I imagine that this man wishes me to do this or that act.' ... And intimation is so called not only because of communicating, but also because of being communicated. Communication by sign is intelligible to others, even to the lower animals. ...>

Conclusion to bodily intimation:

The rupa of bodily intimation is only an <uninterested, momentary dhamma> as we read. It is rupa, it does not know anything. But when cittas arise that wish to display intention, this rupa, a certain, unique change in the great elements, is the means to communicate an intention. Before we realize it we make gestures already or shake our heads, point with our fingers. There are only nama and rupa arising because of their own conditions, there is no person who owns nama and rupa.

Nina.

"The Path of Purification" (Visuddhimagga), Ch. XIV

62. 15. Verbal intimation is the mode (conformation) and the alteration (deformation) in the consciousness-originated earth element that causes that occurrence in speech utterance which mode and alteration are a condition for the knocking together of clung-to matter.²⁸ Its function

is to display intention. It is manifested as the cause of the voice in speech. Its proximate cause is the consciousness-originated earth element. But it is called 'verbal intimation' because it is the cause of the intimating of intention by means of the voice in speech, and because it is itself intimatable through speech, in other words, through that voice in speech. For, just as, on seeing a sign for water consisting of an ox skull, etc., hung up in the forest, it is intimated that 'there is water here', so too, on noticing either the bodily shaking or the voice in speech thus, they intimate. 29 (See Dhs. 637.)

Pali:

62. vaciibhedapavattakacittasamu.t.thaanapathaviidhaatuyaa
upaadi.n.nagha.t.tanassa paccayo aakaaravikaaro vaciivi~n~natti,
adhippaayappakaasanarasaa, vaciighosahetubhaavapaccupa.t.thaanaa,
cittasamu.t.thaanapathaviidhaatupada.t.thaanaa. saa panesaa
vacighosena adhippaayavi~n~naapanahetutta, saya~nca taaya
vacighosasa"nkhaataaya vaacaaya vi~n~neyyattaa ``vacivi~n~nattii"ti
vuccati. yathaa hi ara~n~ne ussaapetvaa bandhagosiisaadiudakanimitta.m
disvaa udakamettha atthiiti vi~n~naayati, eva.m kaayavipphandana~nceva
vacighosa~nca gahetvaa kaayavaciivi~n~nattiyopi vi~n~naayanti.

Tiika:

Atthaavabodhanasamattho vaciiviseso vaciibhedo.

Speech utterance is the difference in voice so that one is capable to understand a meaning.

Tena vaayuvanappatinadiighosaadi.m nivatteti.

Therefore, this excludes the sound of the wind in the forest that is unobstructed, and so on.

Tassa pavattaka.m citta.m samu.t.thaana.m yassaa saa
vacibhedappavattakacittasamu.t.thaanaa, pathaviidhaatu.

That which is originated by citta in the case of the occurrence of speech intimation originated by citta, is the earth element.

Tassaa ya.m upaadinnasa"nkhaatassa akkharuppatti.t.thaanassa
gha.t.tanasa~n~nita.m kicca.m,

The so-called knocking together of what is reckoned as grasped materiality
and the place where the syllables arise is its function,

tassa sahakaariikaara.nabhuuto aakaaraviseso vaciivi~n~natti naamaati
dassento aaha "vaciihbheda..pe..pe.. vaciivi~n~nattii"ti.

and while he explained that the mode of change that has become a
cooperating cause for this is called verbal intimation, he said: "The
utterance of speech...etc. is verbal intimation."

English:

Speech utterance is the difference in voice so that one is capable to
understand a meaning.

Therefore, this excludes the sound of the wind in the forest that is
unobstructed, and so on.

That which is originated by citta in the case of the occurrence of speech
intimation originated by citta, is the earth element.

The so-called knocking together of what is reckoned as grasped materiality
and the place where the syllables arise is its function,

and while he explained that the mode of change that has become a
cooperating cause for this is called verbal intimation, he said: "The
utterance of speech...etc. is verbal intimation."

Note 29. Idaani "kassa pana aakaaravikaaro"ti-aadi kaayavi~n~nattiya.m
vuttanayeneva veditabba.m. Aya.m pana visesoñ yathaa tattha
ìphandamaanava.n.naggaha.naanantaranîti vutta.m, evamidha
ìsuyyamaanasaddasavanaanantaranîti yojetabba.m. Idha ca
thambhanaadiina.m abhaavato ìsattamajavanasambhuutaaîti-aadinayo na
labbhati. Gha.t.tanena hi saddhi.m saddo uppajjati. Gha.t.tana~nca
pa.thamajavanaadiisupi labbhateva. Gha.t.tana.m paccayavasena
bhuutakalaapaana.m a~n~nama~n~na.m aasannataruppaado. Calana.m
ekassaapi desantaruppaadaparamparataati ayametesa.m viseso. Yathaa

ca vaayodhaatuyaa calana.m kicca.m, eva.m pathaviidhaatuyaa
gha.t.tana.m. (end note)

Tiika 2 (after note):

Tenevaaha “pathaviidhaatuyaa upaadinnaagha.t.tanassa paccayo”ti.

Therefore, he said: “The condition is the earth element that knocks together with the materiality that is clung to.”

Sesa.m vuttanayameva.

The rest is what was said before.

Yathaa hiiti-aadi kaayavaciivi~n~nattiina.m anumaanavasena
gahetabbabhaavavibhaavana.m.

As to the words, For, just as, (on seeing a sign for water consisting of an ox skull, etc., hung up in the forest) and so on, the nature of bodily and verbal intimation should be understood as explained by way of inference.

Yathaa hi ussaapetvaa baddhagosiisaadiruupaani disvaa

For, just as, on seeing a sign consisting of an ox skull, etc., hung up in the forest,

tadanantarappavattaaya avi~n~naayamaanantaraaya manodvaaraviithiyaa
gosiisaadiina.m udakasahacaarippakaarasa~n~naa.naakaara.m gahetvaa
udakaggaha.na.m hoti,

immediately after the occurrence of this, and after the moments that there is't any cognizing *, one apprehends by means of the mind-door process that occurs immediately after this, the oxskull etc., that serves as a sign by way of its connection with water, and it is apprehended that there is water ;

eva.m vipphandamaanasamuccaariyamaanava.n.nasadde gahetvaa
evenso, when one has apprehended (bodily) movement and sounds that are uttered,

tadanantarapavattaaya avi~n~naayamaanantaraaya manodvaaraviithiyaa
immediately after the occurrence of this, and after the moments that there is't any cognizing, one apprehends by means of the mind-door process that occurs immediately after this,

purimasiddhasambandhagaha.nuupanissayasahitaaya
saadhippaayavikaaraggaha.na.m hoti.

and which has as its support its connection with what was previously
established **,
the alterations accompanied by intention.

English:

Therefore, he said: “The condition is the earth element that knocks together
with the materiality that is clung to.”

The rest is what was said before.

As to the words, For, just as, (on seeing a sign for water consisting of
an ox skull, etc., hung up in the forest) and so on, the nature of bodily and
verbal intimation should be understood as explained by way of inference.
For, just as, on seeing a sign consisting of an ox skull, etc., hung up in the
forest,

immediately after the occurrence of this, and after the moments that there
is't any cognizing (of an object that impinges on a doorway) *, one
apprehends by means of the mind-door process that occurs immediately
after this, the oxskull etc., that serves as a sign by way of its connection
with water, and it is apprehended that there is water ;

evenso, when one has apprehended (bodily) movement and sounds that
are uttered, immediately after the occurrence of this, and after the moments
that there is't any cognizing (of an object that impinges on a doorway), one
apprehends by means of the mind-door process that occurs immediately
after this,

and which has as its support its connection with what was previously
established **, the alterations accompanied by intention.

* The moments of life-continuum, when there is no cognition of objects
experienced in previous processes. The Co to the
Abhidhammatthasangaha, Exposition of T.A., p. 227, translates; without
noticing the gap. A gap of bhavangacittas is meant here.

** the processes that occurred previously.

*

Remarks:

In the Co to the Abhidhammatthasangaha, Exposition of T.A., p. 227, the text is similar. But here another simile is used: <It is as when, having climbed up high and seen visible forms of sandalwood and palmleaves, one has by means of the mind-door process which occurs immediately following this- though the gap is not noticed- a thought of the kind associating water with sandalwood [leaves] etc. , and apprehends water...>

Thus many processes are succeeding one another and in between there are gaps, the bhavanga-cittas. The cetasika remembrance, sa~n~naa marks different moments and therefore someone knows that there is water. This is conditioned by previous processes of cognizing.

We do not realize this when we understand someone else who is gesticulating or speaking. It seems that we know his intention immediately, but in reality many processes occurred. Many conditions cooperate for the speaker to convey his intention and for the listener to understand the meaning of his speech.

note 28. Vaciibheda--'speech utterance' is not in P.T.S. Dict., which does not give this use of bheda. Pm. (p. 452) explains: 'The function (--"knocking together") of the vocal apparatus (--"clung-to matter").

note 29. Text: 'The question, "It is the mode and the alteration of what?", should be handled in the same way as for bodily intimation, with this difference: for "next to the apprehension of the appearance of movement" substitute "next to the hearing of an audible sound". And here, because of the absence of stiffening, etc., the argument beginning "For it is the air element given rise to by the seventh impulsion" does not apply; for the sound arises together with the knocking together, and the knocking together only applies in the case of the first impulsion, and so on.

N: Quoting from the Co to Abhidhamma Sangaha (p. 226):

<For sound arises simply with the striking together, and striking together is also obtained with the first and subsequent impulsions [javana-cittas]. >
Thus this is different from bodily intimation where only the seventh javanacitta originates bodily communication.

Text: The knocking together is the arising of groups of primaries (bhuuta-kalaapa) in proximity to each other due to conditions. The movement is the progression of the successive arising in adjacent locations. This is the difference.

N: The movement: this refers to bodily intimation, as we have seen. Verbal intimation is knocking together.

I quote from the Co to Abhidhamma Sangaha (p. 226):

<Verbal communication is a single alteration in the consciousness-produced earth-element which causes changes in voice; this becomes the condition for its striking against the grasped materialities at the place where syllables are produced.>

In conventional language we can speak of the vocal cords.

Text: The earth element's knocking together is parallel to the air element's moving as regards function' (Pm. 452).

Hi Larry,

thanks for questions.

op 27-02-2004 23:04 schreef LBIDD@webtv.net op LBIDD@webtv.net:

> 62: "Its function is to display intention."

>

> L: Does "intention" = "meaning"? Can we translate "what do you mean"

> into "what is your intention"? Is the meaning of a concept an intention?

N: In Pali: adhippaaya:

1. intention, wish, desire.

2. sense, meaning, conclusion, inference.

It includes all those things. Certainly also meaning in conventional language, anything you want to convey by speech. Don't we do this all the

time? But we have an idea of my voice, my speech. Only rupas knocking together and cittas that motivate speech. Phenomena rolling on by conditions.

And also intention, yes, cetana that may be kusala or akusala. Akusala kamma is performed by wrong speech, slandering, etc. Before we realize it, the harsh word jumped out of our mouth! So it seems. Whatan amount of evil is done by speech. The Buddha compared the tongue to an ax. And the speaker cuts himself by it. He will bear the consequences.

L: 62: "Verbal intimation is the mode (conformation) and the alteration > (deformation) in the consciousness-originated earth element that causes > that occurrence in speech utterance which mode and alteration are a > condition for the knocking together of clung-to matter."

>

> L: Can we say that the air that passes over the vocal cords is earth > element, not air element? The apparent movement is air element.

N: It is different. Earth element knocks together with earth element. This produces the rupa that is sound in speech. We call it vocal cords in conventional language, but actually, there is concussion of hardness with hardness. We can call it sound base. Thus, in bodily intimation the element of wind (air) plays its specific part, and in verbal intimation the element of earth plays its specific part. As to concussion of earth with earth making a sound: this also happens outside the body. (rupas out there). And also noise inside the body: the sound nonad: the pure octad + sound. This does not originate from citta.

L: "the knocking together of clung-to matter"

Is there any special significance to this term "clung-to matter"? Is it more clung-to than other matter?

N: clung-to or grasped at: upaadi.n.na: this is used all over in the Dhammasangani, and it refers in particular to rupa produced by kamma. Eyesense, etc are clung to, produced by kamma.

Co to Abh. Sangaha, Exposition T.A, (p. 233): <The eighteen kinds by kamma are grasped materiality., since kamma associated with (upeta) craving and views has taken (adinna), taken hold of them as its fruit..> and also (p. 226):

<Verbal communication is a single alteration in the consciousness-produced earth-element which causes changes in voice; this becomes the condition for its striking against the grasped materialities [rupas produced by kamma] at the place where syllables are produced.>

Note: also the lips play their part in articulation. Many conditions involved.

But clung to is also used in a wider sense: all rupas of the body. It can also refer to nama.

What we call vocal cord are rupas produced by kamma. I see here Expositor: I, p. 115 (no 87): <But there is a certain unique change (in the primaries set up by consciousness) which is the cause of bringing about the impact of the element, grasped at by kamma, on that set up by mind. This is speech-intimation.> Grasped at by kamma is a translation of upadi.n.na. But when we say soundbase, there are many groups of rupa involved, also rupas produced by nutrition and temperature.

But clung to is also used in a wider sense: all rupas of the body. It can also refer to nama.

L: Also, it seems there are many intentions involved in intimation. One is > a purely functional one of making the right gesture or sound. This is > most apparent when speaking a foreign language or with loss of memory.

N: See above. Any speaking is done by verbal intimation, also a foreign language, why not? it is natural speech in daily life. We try to convey a meaning.

Loss of memory? My father has this, but he still speaks, having the intention to convey a meaning, though it is at times confused to us.

If someone utters a sound with difficulty, this is because the great Elements that constitute the soundbase are produced by temperature and nutrition that are unsuitable. Hence there are not the right conditions for uttering sound in a natural way and with ease. Well, aging is a cause for this.

L: This intention is distinct from the intention that may be involved in > the "message" of the intimation and the "agenda" behind the message.

Are

> all of these intentions included in the intimation scenario?

N: Yes.

"The Path of Purification" (Visuddhimagga) Ch. XIV

63. 16. The space element has the characteristic of delimiting matter. Its function is to display the boundaries of matter. It is manifested as the confines of matter; or it is manifested as untouchedness, as the state of gaps and apertures (cf. Dhs. 638). Its proximate cause is the matter delimited. And it is on account of it that one can say of material things delimited that 'this is above, below, around, that'.

Pali:

63. ruupaparicchedalakkha.naa aakaasadhaatu,
ruupapariyantappakaasanarasaa, ruupamariyaadaapaccupa.t.thaanaa,
asamphu.t.thabhaavacchiddavivarabhaavapaccupa.t.thaanaa vaa,
paricchinnaruupapada.t.thaanaa. yaaya paricchinnesu ruupesu idamito
uddhamadho tiriyanti ca hoti.

Space, recap, Vis XIV, 36, Tiika: <It is space, because it cannot be broken up, it cannot be ploughed; it is not possible to plough it or to break it, or it does not appear, and thus, one does not enjoy what does not appear; what does not appear is space. Then, because it is without a living soul, it is the element of space. >

Dhammasangani, 638:

That which is space
and belongs to space, is sky and belongs to sky, is vacuum and
belongs to vacuum, and is not in contact with the four Great
Phenomena.

The Expositor II (p. 425)

<...space is that which is not 'scratched', not scratched off, which is not possible to scratch, cut, or break... 'Sky' [in Pali agha] is that which is not struck (a-gha.m); not strikable is the meaning. Aghagata"m is the same. 'Vacuum' (vivara, opening) is in the sense of a hole; also vivaragata.m. By 'untouched by the four great essentials' the unentangled space-element untouched by these is stated...> (follows the definition).

Remarks: untouched, because it is empty, like air. Conventional terms such as cavity of the ear, nose, spaces in the body, are used, helping us to understand its nature. It seems a mere nothing, like air, but still, it performs very neatly its function, separating the groups of rupa. What chaos there would be without it. The groups would not be distinct, they would permeate each other. Each of the groups of octads, nonads, decads etc. plays its own part, it is important that they are distinct. The eyedecad contains eyesense, a necessary condition for seeing. Nobody can say, be there in time, don't fall away, so that you can be base for seeing. It performs its function, arising just for a moment and then gone. The decad of speech intimation (the inseparables, sound and speech intimation) arises at the appropriate time, and nobody can tell it to do so. Speech intimation has performed its function before we realize it. Space surrounds all these different groups.

Though it is not concrete matter and an asabhava rupa, it is bound up with concrete matter since it delimits them. It delimits the groups originated by kamma, citta, nutrition and temperature and therefore reckoned as originated by these four factors. It arises and falls away with them. It is also called an element, dhatu, space-element in the Expositor (II, 425). And the Co to the Abh. Sangaha states: <an element in the sense that it is lifeless>, meaning, it is not a living being. The Vis. gives the characteristic, function, manifestation and proximate cause, as it does in the case of all 28 rupas. It is rupa, thus, it has the three characteristics. And see below, the suttas.

L: There is a slight discrepancy between the PTS (?) translation from MN 140 Nina gave and B. ~Nanamoli's:

PTS: "And what, monk, is the internal element of space? Whatever is space, spacious, is internal, referable to an individual and derived therefrom, such as the auditory and nasal orifices, the door of the mouth..."

~N: "What is the internal space element? Whatever internally, belonging to oneself, is space, spatial, and clung-to, that is, the holes of the

ears, the nostrils, the door of the mouth..."

L: The first one has "derived therefrom" and the second one has "clung-to".

N: It is said: <Derived from an individual>, or, clung to (upadi.n.na): namely, produced by kamma, but in a wider sense referring to all rupas of the body. These two, derived from an individual, or, clung to, amount to the same. They are called internal and individual.

N: B.B. has: <What is internally, belonging to oneself, is space, spatial, and clung to, that is, the holes of the ears, the nostrils...> At the end of this definition we read: <And that should be seen as it actually is with proper wisdom thus: "This is not mine, this I am not, this is not myself."> Would this be said of a concept? It is rupa, an element, not a concept. Going to the Pali of Mahaaraahulovaadasutta: ajjhattika: internal, paccatta.m, belonging to oneself, but used figuratively of course. See the end: they should be realized as non-self. Thus, as rupa, having the three characteristics.

"And what, Rahula, is the space element? The space element may be internal or external. And what, Rahula, is the internal space element? That, internally, and individually, is space, void, and clung to, namely: the cavity of the ear, the orifice of the nose, the opening of the mouth, and whereby (one) swallows what is tasted, chewed, drunk and eaten, and where (food) being tasted, chewed, drunk and eaten remains, and whereby (food) being tasted, chewed, drunk and eaten passes out of the body lower down, or whatever else internally, and individually is space, void, sky, empty, an opening, hollow, untouched by flesh and blood, and clung to. This, Rahula, is called the internal space element. But that very internal space element and that external space element are simply space element. Thus "this is not mine, this I am not, this is not myself" is to be seen with right wisdom just as it is. Having seen this with right wisdom just as it is, the mind becomes dispassionate towards (and) detaches (itself) from the space element."

Nina.

Tiika:

442. Ruupaani paricchindati, saya.m vaa tehi paricchijjati,
It delimits material phenomena or it is itself delimited by them,

ruupaana.m vaa paricchadamatta.m ruupaparicchedo,
or it is just the delimitation of material phenomena, the materiality that is
delimitation,

ta.m lakkha.na.m etissaati ruupaparicchedalakkha.naa.
that is its characteristic, thus, that of delimiting matter.

Aya.m hi aakaasadhaatu ta.m ta.m ruupakalaapa.m paricchindantii viya
hoti.

This is the element of space that is as it were delimiting each of the groups
of material phenomena.

Tenaaha “ruupapariyantappakaasanarasaa”ti.

Therefore he said, “its function is to display the boundary of matter”.

Atthato pana yasmaa ruupaana.m paricchadamatta.m hutvaa gayhati,
tasmaa vutta.m “ruupamariyaadapaccupa.t.thaanaa”ti.

With regard to its meaning, since it is apprehended as having been just the
separation of material phenomena, he said that its manifestation is the
confines of matter.

Yasmi.m kalaape bhuutaana.m paricchedo, teheva
asamphu.t.thabhaavapaccupa.t.thaanaa.

In which group there is the delimitation of the great Elements, its
manifestation is the state of being untouched by these.

Vijjamaanepi hi kalaapantarabhuutaana.m kalaapantarabhuutehi
samphu.t.thabhaave ta.mta.mbhuutavivittataa ruupapariyanto aakaasoti
yesa.m so paricchedo, tehi so asamphu.t.thova.

If contact occurs between one group of the great elements with another group, space is the separation of each of them by delimiting materiality and thus it is the delimitation of those elements by which it is itself also untouched.

A~n~nathaa paricchinnataa na siyaa tesa.m bhuutaana.m
byaapibhaavaapattito.

Otherwise there would be no delimiting of these great elements, but there would be pervasion among them.

Abyaapitaa hi asamphu.t.thataa.

The state of not pervading is the state of being untouched.

Tenaaha bhagavaa “asamphu.t.tha.m catuuhi mahaabhuutehii”ti (dha. sa. 637,

Therefore, the Blessed one said, “untouched by the great Elements.”

Ka.n.nacchiddamukhavivaraadivasena ca
chiddavivarabhaavapaccupa.t.thaanaa vaa.

And because of the cavity in the ear, or the door of the mouth, and so on, its manifestation is the state of cavities and apertures.

Yesa.m ruupaana.m paricchedo, tattheva tesa.m paricchedabhaavena
labbhatiiti vutta.m “paricchinnaruupapada.t.thaanaa”ti.

Of which material phenomena it is the delimitation, there it is applied, and thus he said, “its proximate cause is matter delimited.”

“Yaaya paricchinnesuu”ti-aadinaa aakaasadhaatuyaa

ta.mta.mkalaapaana.m kalaapantarehi asa"nkarakaara.nata.m dasseti.

With the words, “And it is on account of it that one can say of material things delimited (that this is above, below, around, that”)he taught with regard to the element of space that it is the cause for each of the groups that they are not blended with each other.

English:

It delimits material phenomena or it is itself delimited by them, or it is just the delimitation of material phenomena, the materiality that is delimitation,

that is its characteristic, thus, that of delimiting matter.

This is the element of space that is as it were delimiting each of the groups of material phenomena.

Therefore he said, "its function is to display the boundary of matter".

With regard to its meaning, since it is apprehended as having been just the separation of material phenomena, he said that its manifestation is the confines of matter.

In which group there is the delimitation of the great Elements, its manifestation is the state of being untouched by these.

If contact occurs between one group of the great elements with another group, space is the separation of each of them by delimiting materiality and thus it is the delimitation of those elements by which it is itself also untouched.

Otherwise there would be no delimiting of these great elements, but there would be pervasion among them.

The state of not pervading is the state of being untouched.

Therefore, the Blessed one said, "untouched by the great Elements."

And because of the cavity in the ear, or the door of the mouth, and so on, its manifestation is the state of cavities and apertures.

Of which material phenomena it is the delimitation, there it is applied, and thus he said, "its proximate cause is matter delimited."

With the words, "And it is on account of it that one can say of material things delimited (that this is above, below, around, that)", he taught with regard to the element of space that it is the cause for each of the groups that they are not blended with each other.

"The Path of Purification" (Visuddhimagga) Ch. XIV

64. 17. Lightness of matter has the characteristic of non-slowness. Its function is to dispel heaviness of matter. It is manifested as light

transformability. Its proximate cause is light matter (cf. Dhs. 639).

18. Malleability of matter has the characteristic of non-stiffenedness. Its function is to dispel stiffness of matter. It is manifested as non-opposition to any kind of action. Its proximate cause is malleable matter (cf. Dhs. 640).

19. Wioldiness of matter has the characteristic of wioldiness that is favourable to bodily action. Its function is to dispel unwioldiness. It is manifested as non-weakness. Its proximate cause is wioldy matter (cf. Dhs. 641).

65. These three, however, are not found apart from each other. Still their difference may be understood as follows. Lightness of matter is alteration of matter such as any light (agile) state in material instances, as in one who is healthy, any non-slowness, any manner of light transformability in them, which is originated by conditions that prevent any disturbance of elements capable of creating sluggishness of matter.

N: The Tiika explains about disturbance of the elements (dhaatukkhobho) as disturbance by winds (air in the belly), bile and phlegm.

As quoted from "Visuddhimagga" (VIII, 28) about the disturbance of the elements:

.<.. But with the disturbance of the earth element even a strong man's life can be terminated if his body becomes rigid, or with the disturbance of one of the elements beginning with water if his body becomes flaccid and putrifies with a flux of the bowels, etc., or if he is consumed by a bad fever, or if he suffers a severing of his limb-joint ligatures.

When one is healthy, there are conditions for lightness, plasticity and wioldiness of body.>

The Tiika mentions as supporting conditions that obstruct disturbances: <temperature, nutrition and consciousness that is not perplexed or upset. (avikkhitta).>

As we learnt these three factors (all three paramattha dhammas) originate the lightness triad.

As we read in the Expositor: <... Thus ascetics say, “Today we have agreeable food... today we have suitable weather... today our mind is one-pointed, our body is light, plastic and wieldy.”>

Note the word today: these three factors do not always originate the lightness triad. Nobody can choose whether they operate or not. But when they do they are a condition for change. They are rūpas of changeability. That is why it is said in the Vis. text: <any manner of light transformability in them, which is originated by conditions that prevent any disturbance of elements capable of creating sluggishness of matter. >

The last sentence of the Tiika states: <Why are there no lightness etc. for the materiality originated by kamma? This is in view of its being a condition of the past (paccupannapaccaya). Otherwise that (materiality produced by kamma) would always going to be in that way with lightness, etc..>

N: This is understandable when we consider, for example, the bases produced by kamma. Kamma is a cause of the past and keeps on producing the bases at each of the three submoments of citta. Note what is quoted above: today, etc. about the three other factors of nutrition, temperature and citta.

Malleability of matter is alteration of matter such as any malleable state in material instances, as in a well-pounded hide, any pliable manner consisting in amenableness to exercise of power over them in all kinds of work without distinction, which [449] is originated by conditions that prevent any disturbance of elements capable of creating stiffness of matter. Wieldiness of matter is alteration of matter such as any wieldy state in material instances, as in well-refined gold, any manner in them consisting in favourableness to the work of the body, which is originated by conditions that prevent any disturbance of elements capable of creating unfavourableness to the work of the body.

64. adandhataalakkha.naa ruupassa lahutaa, ruupaana.m
garubhaavavinodanarasaa, lahuparivattitaapaccupa.t.thaanaa,

lahuruupapada.t.thaanaa. athaddhataalakkha.naa ruupassa mudutaa,
ruupaana.m thaddhabhaavavinodanarasaa, sabbakiriyaasu
avirodhitaapaccupa.t.thaanaa, muduruupapada.t.thaanaa.
sariirakiriyaanukuulakamma~n~nabhaavalakkha.naa ruupassa
kamma~n~nataa, akamma~n~nataavinodanarasaa,
adubbalabhaavapaccupa.t.thaanaa, kamma~n~naruupapada.t.thaanaa.

65. etaa pana tisso na a~n~nama~n~na.m vijahanti, eva.m santepi yo
arogino viya ruupaana.m lahubhaavo adandhataa lahuparivattippakaaro
ruupadandhattakaradhaatukkhobhapa.tipakkhapaccayasamu.t.thaano, so
ruupavikaaro ruupassa lahutaa. yo pana superimadditacammasseva
ruupaana.m mudubhaavo sabbakiriyaavisesesu
vasavattanabhaavamaddavappakaaro
ruupathaddhattakaradhaatukkhobhapa.tipakkhapaccayasamu.t.thaano, so
ruupavikaaro ruupassa mudutaa. yo pana sudantasuva.n.nasseva
ruupaana.m kamma~n~nabhaavo sariirakiriyaanukuulabhaavappakaaro
sariirakiriyaana.m
ananukuulakaradhaatukkhobhapa.tipakkhapaccayasamu.t.thaano, so
ruupavikaaro ruupassa kamma~n~nataati evametaasa.m viseso veditabbo.

Tiika:

443. Adandhataati agarutaa. Vinodana.m vikkipana.m, apanayananti
attho. Athaddhataati akathinataa. Attano mudubhaaveneva sabbakiriyaasu
avirodhitaa. Mudu hi katthaci na virujjhati. Tiisupi .thaanesu pa.tipakkhe a-
kaaro dandhataadihetuuna.m pa.tipakkhasamu.t.thaanattaa lahutaadiinanti
keci. Apare pana isattaapa.tisedheiti vadanti. Sariirena
kattabbakiriyaana.m anukuulataasa"nkhaatakamma~n~nabhaavo
lakkha.na.m etissaati sariirakiriyaanukuulakamma~n~nabhaavalakkha.naa.
Akamma~n~na.m dubbala.m naama hotiiti kamma~n~nataa
adubbalabhaavapaccupa.t.thaanaa vuttaa.
Lahutaadiina.m a~n~nama~n~naavijahanena duvi~n~neyyanaanattataa
vuttaati ta.mta.mvikaaraadhikarupehi ta.mnaanattappakaasanattha.m
ieva.m santepiiti vutta.m. Dhaatukkhobho vaatapittasemhapakopo,

rasaadidhaatuuna.m vaa vikaaraavatthaa. Dvidhaa vuttopi atthato pathaviidhaatu-aadiina.m dhaatuuna.myeva vikaaroti da.t.thabbo. Pa.tipakkhapaccayaa sappaya-utu-aahaaraavikkhittacittataa. Te ca ta.mta.mvikaarassa visesapaccayabhaavato vutta, avisesena pana sabbe sabbesa.m paccayaa. Yato nesa.m a~n~nama~n~naavijahana.m, iddhiva.la~njanaadiisu viya vasavattana.m maddavappakaaro. Suparimadditacammassudhantasuva.n.nagaha.na~ncettha mudukamma~n~nasadisaruupanidassanamatta.m, na ta.m idha adhippeta.m mudutaakamma~n~nataasabbhaavato. Na hi anindriyabaddharuupasantaane lahutaadiini sambhavanti, indriyabaddhepi ruupabhava na santi dandhattakaraadidhaatukkhobhaabhaavato. Sati hi taadise dhaatukkhobhe tappa.tipakkhapaccayasamu.t.thaanaahi lahutaadiihi bhavitabbanti keci, ta.m akaara.na.m. Na hi vuupasametabbapaccaniikaapekkho tabbirodhidhammasamuppaado, tathaa sati sahetukakiriyacittuppaadesu kaayalahutaadiina.m abhaavova siyaa. Kasmaa pana kammajaruupesu lahutaadayo na hontiiti? Paccuppannapaccayaapekkhattaa. A~n~nathaa sabbadaabhaaviihi lahutaadiihi bhavitabba.m siyaati.

"The Path of Purification" (Visuddhimagga) Ch. XIV

66. 20. 'Growth of matter' has the characteristic of setting up.

Its function is to make material instances emerge in the first instance. It is manifested as launching; or it is manifested as the completed state.

Its proximate cause is grown matter.

N: launching is the translation of niyyaatana: the Tiika explains: as it were making them go out, leading them on (niyyaatento viya).

21. 'Continuity of matter' has the characteristic of occurrence. Its function is to anchor.

N: to anchor: in Pali: anuppabandhana: to follow immediately. The Tiika explains:

Anuppabandhanarasaati pubbaaparavasena anu anu pabandhanakiccaa.

As to the words, its function is following closely, its task is following along in view of what proceeds and what follows.

N: Thus, initial arising is followed immediately by continuation.

Vis text: It is manifested as non-interruption.

Its proximate cause is matter that is anchored.

N: It was explained by A. Sujin recently: each rúpa must arise and fall away, but there is continuation before it decays and falls away. There must be four characteristics, not three. However, there are different methods of teaching.

Vis: Both of these are terms for matter at its birth; but owing to difference of mode, and according to [different persons'] susceptibility to instruction the teaching in the summary (uddesa) in the Dhammasangani is given as 'growth and continuity' (cf. Dhs. 596);

N: according to [different persons'] susceptibility to instruction.

The Tiika says; veneyyavasena: for the sake of people that are capable of being taught. The teaching was adapted to the capabilities of different people.

Vis: but since there is here no difference in meaning, consequently in the description (niddeśa) of these words, 'the setting up of the sense-bases is the growth of matter' and 'the growth of matter is the continuity of matter' is said

(Dhs. 642, 732, 865).

N: Thus, we have to remember that the four characteristics are taught by different methods: according to the duration of one rupa (fiftyone submoments of citta), or by way of conventional sense. As to the last method, we read in the Co to the Abh. Sangaha: <Therein, in the period from relinking (patisandhi) until the arising of the decads (groups of ten rúpas) of the eye, etc. the arising of materiality is called accumulation; after that it is called continuity.> At the moment of rebirth in the human plane there are three decads of rupa produced by kamma: the decads of heartbase, bodysense and sex. The decads of the sense organs arise later on.

66. aacayalakkha.no ruupassa upacayo, pubbantato ruupaana.m
ummujjaapanaraso, niyyaatanapaccupa.t.thaano,

paripu.n.nabhaavapaccupa.t.thaano vaa, upacitaruupapada.t.thaano.
pavattilakkha.naa ruupassa santati, anuppabandhanarasaa,
anupacchedapaccupa.t.thaanaa, anuppabandhakaruupapada.t.thaanaa.
ubhayampeta.m jaatiruupassevaadhivacana.m, aakaaranaanattato pana
veneyyavasena ca ``upacayo santatii"ti uddesadesanaa kataa. yasmaa
panettha atthato naanatta.m natthi, tasmaa imesa.m padaana.m niddese
``yo aayatanaana.m aacayo, so ruupassa upacayo. yo ruupassa upacayo,
saa ruupassa santatii"ti (dha0 sa0 641-642) vutta.m.

"The Path of Purification" (Visuddhimagga) Ch. XIV

67. And in the Commentary, after saying 'It is genesis that is called "setting up", increase that is called "growth", occurrence that is called "continuity" ', this simile is given: 'Genesis as setting up is like the time when water comes up in a hole dug in a river bank; increase as growth is like the time when it fills [the hole]; occurrence as continuity is like the time when it overflows'. And at the end of the simile it is said: 'So what is stated? Setting up is stated by sense-base; sense-base is stated by setting up'. Consequently, it is the first genesis of material instances that is their 'setting up'; the genesis also of others that are generated in addition to those is 'growth' since it appears in the aspect of increase; the repeated genesis also of others that are generated in addition to those is 'continuity' since it appears in the aspect of anchoring. This is how it should be understood to have been declared thus.

67. a.t.thakathaayampi``aacayo naama nibbatti, upacayo naama va.d.dhi,
santati naama pavattii"ti (dha0 sa0 a.t.tha0 641) vatvaa ``nadiitiire
khatakuupakamhi udakuggamanakaalo viya aacayo nibbatti,
paripu.n.nakaalo viya upacayo va.d.dhi, ajjhottharitvaa gamanakaalo viya
santati pavattii"ti (dha0 sa0 a.t.tha0 641) upamaa kataa. upamaavasaane
ca ``eva.m ki.m kathita.m hoti. aayatanaena aacayo kathito, aacayena
aayatana.m kathita"nti vutta.m. tasmaa yaa ruupaana.m
pa.thamaabhinibbatti, saa aacayo. yaa tesa.m upari a~n~nesampi
nibbattamaanaana.m nibbatti, saa va.d.dhiaakaarena upa.t.thaanato

upacayo. yaa tesampi upari punappuna.m a~n~nesa.m
nibbattamaanaana.m nibbatti, saa anupabandhaakaarena upa.t.thaanato
santatiiti ca pavuccatiiti veditabbaa.

68. 22. 'Ageing' has the characteristic of maturing (ripening)
material instances. Its function is to lead on towards [their
termination].

It is manifested as the loss of newness without the loss
of individual essence, like oldness in paddy.

Pali: sabhaavaanapagamepi navabhaavaapagamapaccupa.t.thaanaa
viihipuraa.nabhaavo viya,

Tiika: Sabhaavaanapagamepiiti kakkha.lataadisabhaavassa avigamepi.

As to the expression, without the loss of its specific nature, because the
harshness etc. of this nature has not disappeared.

thitikkha.ne hi jaraa, na ca tadaa dhammo sabhaava.m vijahati naama.

The ageing is during the moments of its presence, then that dhamma does
not abandon its specific nature.

N: The paddy becomes harsh, but it is still paddy. With this simile it is
demonstrated that rupa, after it has arisen, when it is still present, is ageing
and on its way to destruction.

Vis text: Its proximate cause is matter that is maturing (ripening). This is
said with reference to the kind of ageing that is evident through seeing
alteration in teeth, etc., as their brokenness, and so on (cf. Dhs. 644). But
that of immaterial

states, which has no such [visible] alteration, is called hidden ageing.

And that in earth, water, rocks, the moon, the sun, etc., is called
incessant ageing. [450]

Pali Vis:

paripaccamaanaruupapada.t.thaanaa. kha.n.diccaadibhaavena dantaadiisu
vikaaradassanato ida.m paaka.tajara.m sandhaaya vutta.m.

aruupadhammaana.m pana pa.ticchannajaraa naama hoti, tassaa esa
vikaaro natthi, yaa ca pathavii udakapabbatacandimasuuriyaadiisu
aviicijaraa naama.

Tiika:

“Aruupadhammaan”ti ida.m tesa.m jaraaya su.t.thu pa.ticchannataaya vutta.m.

As to the expression, immaterial states, this is said with reference to their ageing that is well hidden.

Ruupadhammaanampi hi kha.nikajaraa pa.ticchannaa eva, yaa aviicijaraatipi vuccati.

Of rupa dhammas the momentary ageing is also hidden, and this is also called incessant (decaying).

Esa vikaaroti kha.n.diccaadivikaaramaaha. So hi aruupadhammesu na labbhati.

As to the expression, such (visible) alteration, he spoke of the alteration as to broken teeth, etc. This cannot be applied to the immaterial dhammas.

Yaa aviicijaraa naama, tassaapi esa vikaaro natthiiti sambandhitabba.m. As to what is called incessant ageing [of rupas], there is no such (visible) alteration of this either in this connection.

Natthi etissaa jaraaya viiciiti aviicijaraa, navabhaavato duvi~n~neyyantaraajaraati attho.

In the case of incessant ageing there is no (visible) alteration, and the meaning is that the ageing is difficult to know because of newness [in appearance].

N: As to ageing of mental phenomena, each citta has three submoments: arising, presence and falling away. These moments are extremely short. At the moment of presence the citta is more powerful, and the cittas that are able to originate rupas can do so only at that moment. The moment of presence of citta and its falling away follows immediately upon the moment of arising. Then citta is succeeded by the next one.

As to incessant ageing, the rupas that constitute a rock are ageing all the time, but this is invisible, since rupas are replaced so long as there are conditions. Thus, this is not as obvious as broken teeth, etc.

Nina.

68. ruupaparipaakalakkha.naa jarataa, upanayanarasaa,
sabhaavaanapagamepi navabhaavaapagamapaccupa.t.thaanaa
viihipuraa.nabhaavo viya, paripaccamaanaruupapada.t.thaanaa.
kha.n.diccaadibhaavena dantaadiisu vikaaradassanato ida.m
paaka.tajara.m sandhaaya vutta.m. aruupadhammaana.m pana
pa.ticchannajaraa naama hoti, tassaa esa vikaaro natthi, yaa ca pathavii
udakapabbatacandimasuuriyaadiisu aviicijaraa naama.

68 Tiika:

Ruupaparipaako ruupadhammaana.m ji.n.nataa. Upanayanarasaati
bha"ngupanayanakicca. Sabhaavaanapagamepiiti
kakkha.lataadisabhaavassa avigamepi. thitikkha.ne hi jaraa, na ca tadaa
dhammo sabhaava.m vijahati naama. Navabhaavo uppaadaavatthaa,
tassa apagamabhaavena gayhatiiti aaha
inavabhaavaapagamapaccupa.t.thaanaaîti. iAruupadhammaanânîti ida.m
tesa.m jaraaya su.t.thu pa.ticchannataaya vutta.m. Ruupadhammaanampi
hi kha.nikajaraa pa.ticchannaa eva, yaa aviicijaraatipi vuccati. Esa vikaaroti
kha.n.diccaadivikaaramaaha. So hi aruupadhammesu na labbhati. Yaa
aviicijaraa naama, tassaapi esa vikaaro natthiiti sambandhitabba.m. Natthi
etissaa jaraaya viiciiti aviicijaraa, navabhaavato duvi~n~neyyantarajaraati
attho.

69. 23. 'Impermanence of matter' has the characteristic of complete
breaking up. Its function is to make material instances subside. It is
manifested as destruction and fall (cf. Dhs. 645). Its proximate cause
is matter that is completely breaking up.

Pali: 69. paribhedalakkha.naa ruupassa aniccataa, sa.msiidanarasaa,
khayavayapaccupa.t.thaanaa, paribhijjamaanaruupapada.t.thaanaa.

Tiika:

Parito sabbaso "bhijjanan"ti lakkhitabbaati paribhedalakkha.naa.
The characteristic of complete breaking up should be defined as being
destroyed absolutely and in every respect *.

Nicca.m naama dhuva.m, ruupa.m pana kha.nabha"ngitaaya yena bha"ngena na niccanti anicca.m, so aniccassa bhaavoti aniccataa. What is lasting is called permanent, but materiality at the moment of its falling away is not lasting because of its dissolution, and thus it is impermanent, and that state of instability is impermanence.

Saa pana yasmaa .thitippatta.m ruupa.m vinaasabhaavena sa.msiidantii viya hotiiti vutta.m "sa.msiidanarasaa"ti.

He said that its function is to make (material instances) subside, since this (impermanence) causes the materiality that has reached (the moments of) presence ** as it were to subside.

Yasmaa ca saa ruupadhammaana.m bha"ngabhaavato khayavayaakaareneva gayhati, tasmaa vutta.m "khayavayapaccupa.t.thaanaa"ti.

And since this (impermanence) because of the state of dissolution of material phenomena should be taken by way of destruction and fall, he said that it is manifested as destruction and fall.

English:

The characteristic of complete breaking up should be defined as being destroyed absolutely and in every respect *.

What is lasting is called permanent, but materiality at the moment of its falling away is not lasting because of its dissolution, and thus it is impermanent, and that state of instability is impermanence.

He said that its function is to make (material instances) subside, since this (impermanence) causes the materiality that has reached (the moments of) presence** as it were to subside.

And since this (impermanence) because of the state of dissolution of material phenomena should be taken by way of destruction and fall, he said that it is manifested as destruction and fall.

* The word meaning is partly lost in the translation. The prefix pari of paribheda, breaking up, reinforces the word. The words parito, completely and sabbaso, in every respect, are added.

** Origination, upacaya rúpa, and continuity, santati rúpa, are characteristics indicating the moments rúpa has arisen but not yet fallen away, whereas decay, jaratá rúpa, indicates the moment close to its falling away and impermanence, aniccatá rúpa, the moment of its falling away. These moments are extremely short. Thus, as soon as rupa is present it is already time for its falling away.

Remark: The short definitions in the Vis. can be easily overlooked, and therefore I am glad to see the Tiika text which emphasizes more the facts of decay and impermanence occurring each moment. All rupas of the body are decaying now and they are on the way to complete destruction. This is dukkha and a grim reminder of being in the cycle of birth and death.

> Can upacaya exist at cuti?

N: Cuti-citta, dying-consciousness is the last citta in life. When cuti-citta falls away, rupa produced by kamma falls away. Cuti-citta is very weak and it does not produce rupa, thus no rupa produced by citta. Nutrition also stops producing, it does not produce any rupa in a corpse. Only temperature or heat element goes on producing rupas. The corpse is like dead matter outside, originated by temperature. This is recollection of death, maranasati.

Reckoned backward from cuti-citta, sixteen moments of citta before the cuti-citta kamma produces rupa for the last time. The characteristic of origination of rupa applies at that moment. Thus, not at the moment of cuti-citta, the rupa falls away together with cuti-citta, that is the characteristic of impermanence of rupa.

H: Can aniccata exist at patisandhi?

N: At the moment the patisandhi-citta arises, kamma produces, when birth is in the human plane, three decads: of bodysense, of heartbase and of sex. Thus, thirtythree rupas. They arise in three groups of ten each. That is the moment of their arising, thus, the characteristic of origination applies here. And the characteristic of origination has to be followed by

continuation, decay and impermanence. This is nyama, the fixed law of Dhamma. Nobody can change this.

>

H: Can all 4 lakkhana rupa exist in a rupa?

N: All four characteristics of rupa are to be applied to each rupa as it comes into being, develops, decays and breaks up, one after the other, and this happens unthinkably fast. All during the seventeen (or fiftyone) moments of citta. We cannot imagine how fast. And when thinking of the last moments of life, we cannot imagine how fast all that happens. Before we realize it, another life has begun, and if that is in a plane where there are nama and rupa, again the four characteristics of rupa apply. You give me a good meditation on death!

70. 24. 'Physical nutriment' has the characteristic of nutritive essence. Its function is to feed kinds of matter. It is manifested as consolidating. Its proximate cause is a physical basis that must be fed with physical food. It is a term for the nutritive essence by means of which living beings sustain themselves (cf. Dhs. 646).

Vis. 70. ojaalakkha.no kaba.liikaaro aahaaro, ruupaahara.naraso,
upatthambhanapaccupa.t.thaano, kaba.la.m katvaa
aaharitabbavatthupada.t.thaano. yaaya ojaaya sattaa yaapenti, tassaa
eta.m adhivacana.m.

Tiika:

Ojaalakkha.noti ettha a"ngama"ngaanusaarino rasassa saaro
upathambhabalakaro bhuutanissito eko viseso ojaa.

As to the words, the characteristic of nutritive essence, this means, while making here a certain distinction, nutrition that is the essence of the fluid that pervades the constituent parts (of the body) and that is the cause of sustaining the body.

Kaba.la.m kariiyatiiti kaba.liikaaro.

Edible food is made into morsels.

Aahariiyatiiti aahaaro, kaba.la.m katvaa ajjhohariiyatiiti attho.
It is consumed and thus it is food, after it is made into morsels it is
swallowed, is meant.

Ida.m pana savatthuka.m oja.m dassetu.m vutta.m.
He said this in order to explain nutritive essence with the substance *.

Baahira.m aahaara.m paccaya.m labhitvaa eva ajjhattikaahaaro ruupa.m
uppaadeti, so pana ruupa.m aaharatiiti aahaaro.
After external food has been obtained as a condition, internal nutrition
produces materiality, it feeds materiality and thus, this is nutrition.

Tenaaha “ruupaahara.naraso”ti.
Thus he said that its function is to feed materiality.

Tato eva oja.t.thamakaruupuppaadanena imassa kaayassa
upathambhanapaccupa.t.thaano.
Therefore, because it generates the octads with nutrition as the eighth **
constituent in this body, its manifestation is consolidating.

Ojaaya ruupaahara.nakicca.m baahiraadhiinanti aaha
“aaharitabbavatthupada.t.thaano”ti.
With external food as a condition the function of nutrition is feeding
materiality, and thus, he said, its proximate cause is a physical basis that
must be fed.

English:

As to the words, the characteristic of nutritive essence, this means, while
making here a certain distinction, nutrition that is the essence of the fluid
that pervades the constituent parts (of the body) and that is the cause of
sustaining the body.

Edible food is made into morsels.

It is consumed and thus it is food, after it is made into morsels it is swallowed, is meant.

He said this in order to explain nutritive essence with the substance *.

After external food has been obtained as a condition, internal nutrition produces materiality, it feeds materiality and thus, this is nutrition.

Thus he said that its function is to feed materiality.

Therefore, because it generates the octads with nutrition as the eighth ** constituent in this body, its manifestation is consolidating.

With external food as a condition the function of nutrition is feeding materiality, and thus, he said, its proximate cause is a physical basis that must be fed.

*The substance (vatthu) is the morsel made food that is swallowed. This external food contains nutritive essence that pervades the body and sustains it. Nutritive essence arises and falls away.

** The eight inseparable rupas are the four Great Elements, visible object, odour, flavour and nutritive essence. These octads arise and fall away in a living body and also in dead matter. Only in a living body nutrition can produce new rupas.

From the Guide to Conditional Relations, U. Narada (p.55, 56). He deals with physical and mental nutrition that are conditions. (The mental nutritions are: contact, volition and contact). Here I shall quote what is said about physical nutrition.

15. Nutriment Condition (Aahaara paccaya).

<...The force of support is the essential function. Although nutriment condition has two functions, that of support and that of production, the former is its essential function.

How Physical Nutriment supports. When food is taken, the nutritive essence in it not only produces nutriment-produced matter but also supports kamma-produced matter, mind-produced matter and temperature-produced matter in the whole body by keeping them strong and fresh. That is why these three kinds of matter continue to arise successively.

When there is no support by physical (i.e. external) nutriment because food is not taken, the nutritive essence in each of the types of matter produced by the four causes in the whole body (i.e. internal nutriment) carries out the function of support only. But when food is taken, the nutritive essence from external food carries out the other function of production, i.e. producing nutriment-produced matter. Human beings commonly can go without food for seven days only...

How Nutritive Essence Supports Womb-born Beings, etc.

Before the nutritive essence in the food taken by the mother is distributed throughout the foetus, the latter is supported by the nutritive essence in each of the types of matter produced by the three causes. But when it is distributed, nutriment-produced matter is produced for the first time and from then onwards nutritive essence in foods supports the body for the whole period of an existence...>

(See also Co to the Sammaditthi Sutta, under: physical food.)

Remarks: We should remember that the Tiika is not a medical treatise. It emphasizes the specific conditions necessary for the body to function. The goal is detachment from the idea of self or mine. We take all our bodily functions for granted, but we should remember that many different conditioning factors are needed for its functioning. All the rupas that constitute the body arise and fall away immediately. They are replaced so long as there are conditions for life to continue.

As we read in the Guide to Conditional Relations, <When food is taken, the nutritive essence in it not only produces nutriment-produced matter but also supports kamma-produced matter, mind-produced matter and temperature-produced matter in the whole body by keeping them strong and fresh. That is why these three kinds of matter continue to arise successively.>

This passage helps us to see all the more how intricate the different conditioning factors are that cooperate to cause the functioning of the body. We can be reminded that the body we cling to are only conditioned rupas, not mine. We cling to our physical health, but we are not the owner of the body. Kamma, citta, temperature and nutrition originate rupas of the body during our life. It depends on kamma how long life lasts.

"The Path of Purification" (Visuddhimagga) Ch. XIV, 71

Pali:

imaani taava paa.liya.m aagataruupaaneva. a.t.thakathaaya.m pana
balaruupa.m sambhavaruupa.m jaatiruupa.m rogaruupa.m ekaccaana.m
matena middharuupanti eva.m a~n~naanipi ruupaani aaharivaa ``addhaa
muniisi sambuddho, natthi niivara.naa tavaa"tiaadiini (su0 ni0 546) vatvaa
middharuupa.m taava natthiyevaati pa.tikkhitta.m. itaresu rogaruupa.m
jarataaaniccataaggaha.nena gahitameva, jaatiruupa.m
upacayasantatiggaha.nena, sambhavaruupa.m aapodhaatuggaha.nena,
balaruupa.m vaayodhaatuggaha.nena gahitameva. tasmaa tesu ekampi
visu.m natthiiti sannit.thaana.m kata.m.

iti ida.m catuviisatividha.m upaadaaruupa.m pubbe vutta.m catubbidha.m
bhuutaruupa~ncaati a.t.thaviisatividha.m ruupa.m hoti
anuunamanadhika.m.

Vis. 71. These, firstly, are the material instances that have been handed down in the texts.(30) But in the Commentary others have been added as follows: matter as power, matter as procreation, matter as birth, matter as sickness; and, in the opinion of some, matter as torpor.

N: The monks of the Abhayagiri monastery had opinions different from the Mahaavihaara (Great Monastery, where Buddhaghosa was residing). The opinions on rupas of the monks of Abhayagiri were rejected. They wanted to add other rupas to the twentyeight rupas as handed down in the texts. We see here that Buddhaghosa was most conscientious in rendering other opinions. At other places we can read: some teachers say... (keci, some). The Tiika gives a long explanation about torpor, middha which the monks of Abhayagiri said to be an additional rupa. (See also Exposition of the Topics of Abhidhamma, p. 61).

Vis: In the first place, 'matter as torpor' is rejected as non-existent by the words:

'Surely thou art a sage enlightened, there are no hindrances in thee'

(Sn. 541).

N: It is explained that it must be mental, a cetasika, since it is one of the hindrances that should be overcome. There is a discussion about the sleep of a Buddha or arahat which is not caused by any defilements such as sloth and torpor.

The Tiika renders the discussion:

...Yadi middhassa ruupabhaava.m na sampa.ticchatha, katha.m bhagavato niddaa.

If you do not accept the material state of torpor, how is there sleep for the Blessed One?

Middha~nhi "niddaapacalaayikaa"ti-aadinaa vibha"nge vibhattattaa niddaati?

Is sleep not classified in the Vibhanga as torpor with the words, sleepy and weary"?

Niddaa bhagavato sariiragilaaniyaa, na middhena.

The sleep of the Blessed One is because of bodily exhaustion, not because of torpor.

Saa ca natthiiti na sakkaa vattu.m "pi.t.thi me aagilaayati, tamaha.m aayamissaamii"ti (ma. ni. 2.22) vacanato.

If this is not so he could not say the words, my back is weary, I will stretch it."

Tena vutta.m "niddaa bhagavato sariiragilaaniyaa, na middhena"ti.

Therefore it is said, "The sleep of the Blessed One is because of bodily exhaustion, not because of torpor."

Vis: As to the rest, 'matter as sickness' is included by ageing and by impermanence; 'matter as birth' by growth and continuity; 'matter as procreation' by the water element; and 'matter as power' by the air element. So taken separately not even one of these exists: this was the

agreement reached.

So this derived matter of twenty-four sorts and the aforesaid matter of the primary elements, which is of four sorts, together amount to twenty-eight sorts, neither more nor less.

Pali Vis: iti ida.m catuviisatividha.m upaadaaruupa.m pubbe vutta.m catubbidha.m bhūtaruupa~ncaati a.t.thaviisatividha.m ruupa.m hoti anuunamanadhika.m.

Tiika:

“Itii”ti ida.m “a.t.thaviisatividhan”ti iminaa sambandhitabba.m,
As to the expression, this, this should be connected with the expression, twentyfour kinds,

iminaa vuttakkamena a.t.thaviisatividha.m hotiiti.

by this procedure that was mentioned there are twentyeight kinds (of materiality).

So ca kho paa.liya.m aagatanayenevaati anuunataa veditabbaa.

And this should truly be known as being complete since it is handed down in this manner in the texts.

Anadhikabhaavo pana dassito eva.

This is shown as being indeed not more (than that).

English:

The Tiika renders the discussion:

If you do not accept the material state of torpor, how is there sleep for the Blessed One?...

Is sleep not classified in the Vibhanga as torpor with the words, sleepy and weary”?

The sleep of the Blessed One is because of bodily exhaustion, not because of torpor.

If this is not so he could not say the words, my back is weary, I will stretch it.”

Therefore it is said, “The sleep of the Blessed One is because of bodily exhaustion, not because of torpor.”

Vis 71 text:

So this derived matter of twenty-four sorts and the aforesaid matter of the primary elements, which is of four sorts, together amount to twenty-eight sorts, neither more nor less.

Tiika:

As to the expression, this, this should be connected with the expression, twentyfour kinds,

by this procedure that was mentioned there are twentyeight kinds (of materiality).

And this should truly be known as being complete since it is handed down in this manner in the texts.

This is shown as being indeed not more (than that).

Remarks:

The Tiika gives an additional emphasis to the text of the Vis. about the number of rupas as exactly twentyeight. There are not more than these twentyeight, as the monks of Abhayagiri suggested. They are all rupas, realities, not ideas or concepts.

Vis. 72:

And all that [matter of twenty-eight sorts] is of one kind as 'not-root-cause, root-causeless, dissociated from root-cause, with conditions, mundane, subject to cankers' (Dhs. 584), and so on.

It is of two kinds as internal and external, gross and subtle, far and near, produced ('nipphanna') and unproduced, sensitive matter and insensitive matter, faculty and non-faculty, clung to and not-clung to, and so on.

Vis. 72. ta.m sabbampi na hetu ahetuka.m hetuvippayutta.m sappaccaya.m lokiya.m saasavamevaatiaadinaa nayena ekavidha.m.

ajjhattika.m baahira.m, o.laarika.m sukhuma.m, duure santike,
nipphanna.m anipphanna.m, pasaadaruupa.m napasaadaruupa.m,
indriya.m anindriya.m, upaadi.n.na.m anupaadi.n.nantiaadivasena
duvidha.m.

Intro to Tiika Vis. 72 (part I).

The Tiika explains all the expressions of the Vis. used for: being without roots. This part seems very technical, but it is truly about life.

Vis text: And all that [matter of twenty-eight sorts] is of one kind as not-root-cause, root-causeless, dissociated from root-cause.

Vis. Pali: na hetu, ahetuka.m, hetuvippayutta.m.

Tiika explains: non-root, na-hetu, rootless, ahetuka.m, dissociated from roots, hetuvippayutta.m.

Sampayutta is associated with and vippayutta is dissociated from. These expressions are used in the classifications of cittas. Kusala citta, for example, can be associated with or dissociated from pa~n~naa. Akusala citta can be associated with or dissociated from wrong view.

Rupa is na-hetu, meaning, non-root. Rupa it is not one of the akusala roots that are attachment, aversion, ignorance; or one of the sobhana (beautiful) roots that are: non-attachment, non-aversion and wisdom.

In the Abhidhamma all realities can be classified as: root (hetu) and non-root (na-hetu). Citta, all the cetasikas other than these roots and nibbana are non-root.

In Pali the terms ahetuka, without roots, and hetu-vippayutta, dissociated from roots are used. The term ahetuka is used for citta without roots, ahetuka citta. In the English translation the meaning of these terms cannot be rendered justice. It seems that there is a mere repetition of the same terms.

However, the Tiika text emphasizes with all these synonyms that rupa is entirely different from nama, that it is not associated with any of those roots. Rupa does not know anything. How could the Element of earth, solidity or hardness, be angry or attached? How could eyesense or visible object be attached? This seems obvious, but in the development of insight doubts are bound to arise when they actually appear. For example, the root

of dosa, anger or fear, conditions bodily phenomena, such as hardness. Sati can be aware of one object at a time, but we may be confused as to the object that presents itself: is it the nama which has aversion or is it the rupa that is just hardness? Hardness is non-root. When visible object is seen, we can be reminded that it is only rupa, not a person. Visible object cannot be angry or attached, it is non-root. When we burn ourselves the element of heat impinges on the bodysense. Heat and bodysense are rupas, they are non-root, they cannot be accompanied by aversion. Painful bodily feeling and mental unhappy feeling may arise closely one after the other. It is difficult to distinguish these different dhammas. Painful bodily feeling is ahetuka vipakacitta and unhappy feeling is sahetuka, it accompanies the root that is dosa.

At the first stage of insight nama and rupa are clearly distinguished from each other. It is beneficial to reflect on this concise text of the Tiika, it can remind us that understanding of the difference between nama and rupa should be developed.

The word veneyya, people to be taught, is used in this text. Because of people's different capacities to absorb the Dhamma, different methods of teaching are used. We see the Buddha's great compassion in using different terms and different approaches.

Tiika of Vis. 72. Sampayuttadhammaraasi hinoti etena pati.t.thahatihi hetu, muula.t.thena lobhaadiko, alobhaadiko ca, taadiso hetu na hotiiti nahetu.

As to the group of associated dhammas, this is the term for the roots that are foundations, meaning the roots of attachment etc., and non-attachment, and so on, and non-root means that there are not such roots.

Naassa hetu atthiiti ahetuka.m, sahetukapa.tiyogibhaavato hetunaa saha na uppajjatiiti attho.

Rootless (ahetuka) means that there is no root for it (rupa), meaning, it does not arise with a root since the state of being accompanied with roots is inapplicable.

Ahetukameva hetunaa vippayuttataaya hetuvippayutta.m.

Since it is indeed rootless (ahetuka) it is because of its dissociation from roots, thus, it is dissociated from roots (hetuvippayutta).

Dhammanaanattaabhaavepi hi saddatthanaanattena veneyyavasena
dukantaradesanaa hotiiti dukapadavasena ceta.m vutta.m.

Also, because there are different kinds of dhammas, different kinds of faithful and different people who are capable of being taught, there is the teaching of additional compounds, and thus this was expressed by way of compound words *.
